

## Swansea's Assessment of Local Well-being 2022

### Annex 2: Consultation Feedback Report

#### 1. Introduction

- 1.1. This report outlines the consultation on Swansea Public Services Board's draft Assessment of Local Well-being 2022, the feedback received during the consultation period and proposed response of the Board.
- 1.2. The consultation ran from 22 February to 18 March 2022. Respondents were encouraged to complete the on-line survey or could submit comments and suggestions on the assessment (as a whole or specific sections) by email or post. Towards the end of the consultation period (15 March), reminder emails were sent to all those originally contacted.
- 1.3. The assessment consultation was promoted through:
  - Statutory consultees, as listed under the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015
  - Other organisations, including those on the circulation list for the Public Services Board (PSB) partnership
  - The above were also encouraged to circulate the consultation to any relevant contacts and networks
  - Swansea Council press release and website – 'News' and 'Have your say' (public consultation) pages
  - Swansea Council's social media accounts: Facebook and Twitter (on 23 February, 12 March and 17 March)
  - Local media (e.g. *Evening Post* item, 24 February 2022).
- 1.4. Section 2 of this report contains a schedule of feedback from the consultation survey, both general and by assessment chapter, together with the Board's proposed response in each case. The separate organisation responses received can also be found in Appendices 2-4 of this report:
  - Appendix 1 – Questionnaire for Consultation Draft and Results Summary
  - Appendix 2 – Welsh Government Response
  - Appendix 3 – Future Generations Commissioner's Response
  - Appendix 4 – Natural Resources Wales Response.

## 2. Feedback and Responses

Swansea Public Services Board is committed to The National Principles for Public Engagement in Wales. This recommends that people are told the impact of their contribution.

The table below shows how Swansea Public Services Board (PSB) has responded to the feedback received from the consultation on the draft Assessment of Local Well-being 2022. Each proposal was considered at meetings of the Assessment Editorial Group in March-April 2022 attended by individual chapter leads and PSB statutory member representatives.

Responses to the feedback are categorised in up to three ways, with the response and additional comments in the right column:

- **A:** the Draft Assessment has been amended
- **N:** after consideration, no change has been made
- **P:** referred to the Public Services Board for consideration, as part of the preparation of the Local Well-being Plan in 2022/23.

Ref.) / Chapter / Comment	Where did it come from?	Response
G1) General  We note the academic research commissioned to highlight the key implications and messages (the 'so what') from the draft well-being assessment. While this is positive to hear, it's not clear from the information set out if these findings would be included in the final well-being assessment, or if this is intended as information aimed at PSB members to help inform next steps as attention shifts to the well-being plan? Clarity on this within the assessment would be helpful.	Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p3)	A / P  The findings of this research will not be included in this assessment but will be published in a separate report. The research commission will be used to inform the next steps towards the well-being plan. The assessment text will be amended to clarify this.
G2) General  <b>Involvement</b> – Building on your positive work to date, we encourage you to consider including further	Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p3)	A / P

<p>information (and reflection) on the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What you consider to be the strengths and challenges of your engagement work to date.</li> <li>• Identifying the ‘seldom heard voices’ you are seeking to involve.</li> <li>• Any approaches or tools you’ve identified that could potentially improve your work to involve people going forward.</li> <li>• Using and including quotes from residents within the assessment (we note annex 1 states these will be included in the final published assessment).</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A. We will look to expand upon this within an additional Annex – ‘Background to the Assessment’.</li> <li>• A. We will look to clarify as part of an additional Annex – ‘Background to the Assessment’.</li> <li>• P. To be considered as part of the Well-being Plan process where involvement is a more central element.</li> <li>• A. Quotes from the public survey were added to chapters of the final assessment.</li> </ul>
<p>G3) General</p> <p><b>Future Trends</b> – we recommend full consideration is given to the <a href="#">Future Trends Report</a> (published in December 2021) to help better inform and strengthen the assessment. This should be carried out in relation to and across all four dimensions of well-being. It would also be helpful to understand how the PSB intends to continue to consider and embed future trends information into its next steps, including the development of a well-being plan and setting of objectives and steps. Futures techniques are effective tools for engaging with others and prompting constructive discussion in a way that can help develop plans that deliver meaningful change.</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p4)</p>	<p>P / A</p> <p>Information from the Future Trends report has informed aspects of this assessment, although not as comprehensively as we would have liked due to resources. However, we acknowledge this as an issue and are committed to consider future trends more fully during the Well-being Plan process. The Introduction pages in the final assessment were amended to reflect this.</p>
<p>G4) General / multiple chapters</p> <p>We acknowledge the assessment highlights existing</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p6)</p>	

<p>gaps. Building on the positive work undertaken to date, we recommend:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ensuring all <a href="#">‘protected characteristics’</a> outlined in the Equality Act are considered within the assessment.</li> <li>• Some consideration is given to how intersectionality affects people in the area. For example, what is like to be young and LGBTQ+ in Swansea? We note in the ‘Listening to young people’ section, children and young people highlighted ‘Equality for LGBTQ+ children and young people’ as a key issue.</li> <li>• Making the links to your engagement work on engaging with seldom heard voices, as this develops.</li> </ul> <p>We also encourage you to consider the implications of our recent <a href="#">‘Inequality in a future Wales’</a> report. This highlights the how future of work, changing demographics and climate change could increase existing inequalities if the impacts on different groups in society are not factored in.</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• N. The protected characteristics outlined in the Equality Act have been considered as far as possible, in particular within the Social well-being and Swansea Profile chapters.</li> <li>• N. Comment noted, but resource / time constraints limited further consideration.</li> <li>• P. We acknowledge this as an issue and are committed to engaging more fully with seldom heard voices during the Well-being Plan process.</li> </ul> <p>‘Inequality in a future Wales’ report – N / P. Comment noted, but resource and time constraints limit further consideration at this stage. However, the report will be considered as a resource to inform the Well-being Plan process.</p>
<p>G5) General / multiple chapters</p> <p>Understanding the full definition of Wales’ well-being goals can help ensure the assessment is considering the wide range of topics and themes of well-being within your area. The below sets out areas that could be explored further within the assessment, and/or taken into consideration for the well-being plan. It is appreciated that it may not be possible for all the information below to be fully considered / incorporated in your assessment. Instead, you may</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p6-7)</p>	<p>Welsh Language – P. To be considered as part of Well-being Plan process.</p> <p>Fair and local procurement – A. Information on procurement and the Beyond Bricks and Mortar (BBM) initiative has been added to Economy chapter (Business Base section). There is information in the Economy chapter introduction about local sourcing and supporting local firms on procurement.</p>

<p>wish to choose some areas to compliment the extensive work you have already undertaken:</p> <p><b>Welsh Language</b> – As the PSB’s attention shifts to the well-being plan, we recommend clear links are made to your local authority’s promotional strategy and your relevant Welsh in Education Strategic Plan (WESP).</p> <p><b>Fair and local procurement</b> – Our <a href="#">bitesize resource on procurement</a> provides a helpful summary on the Commissioner’s vision for procurement, identifying the key issues highlighted by public bodies during the research and Section 20 Review, as well as the recommendations outlined in our <a href="#">‘Procuring well-being in Wales’</a> report.</p> <p><b>Brexit</b> – Likely to have an impact for Swansea and its residents, e.g., EU citizens residing in the city, the ability of businesses to import and export goods, and sectors such as tourism and the creative industries that have relied on free movement of people. The WCPP’s briefing: <a href="#">‘The impacts of Covid-19 and Brexit on well-being’</a> is a helpful resource on this.</p> <p><b>Regional Skills Partnership</b> – It’s not clear if the links have been made with your local Regional Skills Partnership. Your assessment will be a significant resource for them. Similarly, their strategies and priorities will be key for your PSB. Please also see above points on skills for the future.</p>		<p>Brexit – A. Reference to Brexit and its impacts have been added to the Economy chapter introduction.</p> <p>Regional Skills Partnership – A. Reference added in context of Skills &amp; Talent project.</p>
<p>G6) General</p> <p><b>Localised data:</b> The draft assessment provides some breakdown of data to smaller geographies within</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p7)</p>	<p>P / A</p> <p>The difficulty of doing this consistently through the assessment is clear, but resource / time constraints</p>

<p>Swansea, but this could be more consistent through the document (where possible to do so). Comparison of different areas can be helpful to highlight local inequalities, any best practice from programmes delivered at a local level, and to identify where targeted interventions may be required.</p>		<p>limited further consideration. However, statistical profiles of the Community Areas will be provided in an Annex (as in 2017) to highlight basic area characteristics and differences, with key statistics for each area also noted in the 'Swansea Profile' chapter.</p>
<p>G7) General / multiple chapters</p> <p><b>Integration:</b> A strong feature of the assessment which recognises many issues are inter-connected. Structuring a well-being assessment by well-being dimension does works well but there are some sections where clearer links could be made to other areas/chapters of the assessment. For example, the chapter on poverty is extensive and includes fuel and food poverty, and further links could be made here to the environment and economy chapters. Similarly, while integration is discussed in relation to digital connectivity where it states: “there are also links to aspects of the social chapter, including housing and poverty”, it would be helpful in examples like this if some further information/context could be provided on how this is the case.</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p7)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>The Integration aspects of the final assessment have been highlighted and built on where possible. This aspect will also be a key part of the academic research commission, as noted in the Introduction.</p>
<p>G8) General</p> <p><b>Collaboration:</b> Building on the collaborative approach taken to developing the assessment in the region, it would be beneficial if the assessment identified who all the partners were and how the collaboration was</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p7)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>We will look to include this information in a new 'Background' annex to the main assessment, along with further detail on aspects of the overall process (as was done in 2017).</p>

<p>managed. This information would help for future learning, as cross-sector collaboration is a challenging but often effective means of delivering social change.</p>		
<p>G9) General</p> <p>The 'economy' chapter finishes with a section on 'Overall Conclusions'. For consistency, you may wish to include a similar section in the other three main chapters.</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p8)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>The presentation of the Economy chapter has been amended slightly to be more in line with the other dimension chapters.</p>
<p>G10) General</p> <p>Links to the sub-topics where they are listed in the introductory chapter would be beneficial and increase navigability.</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p8)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>We will look to add links to the introductions of each of the dimension-based chapters.</p>
<p>G11) General / Introduction</p> <p>Statutory Requirements – The assessment is based around the same six community areas that were used in the 2017 well-being assessment. The introduction briefly sets out the community areas and they are occasionally referenced in parts of the assessment; however, we would like to see a lot more analysis broken down by these areas throughout the analysis and any differences or similarities between the community areas highlighted. By assessing the well-being of each community, it gives a better understanding of the diversity of the PSB area, and how the varying characteristics of each community impact on well-being, which in turn, helps determine the priorities. It would also be useful to include more</p>	<p>Welsh Government (p2 &amp; p6)</p>	<p>P / A</p> <p>Resource and time constraints limited our scope to improve this aspect of the assessment. However, development of this information will be needed in terms of discussions on priorities, especially those that are spatially defined. Initial statistical profiles of the Community Areas will be provided in an Annex to highlight basic area characteristics, differences and inequalities, with key statistics and features of each area also noted in the 'Swansea Profile' chapter.</p>

<p>background information on the community areas in the introduction, for example an overview of their key characteristics and features, in order to give the reader a better sense of the area and its geography. In summary, <i>More attempt to compare and contrast the community areas.</i> (WG <b>category B</b>)</p>		
<p>G12) General</p> <p>There is a good use of a range of tables and figures that are clearly explained and signposted throughout the assessment. However, it is important to ensure that they are consistently presented and include a title, an x and y label, and the data source.</p>	<p>Welsh Government (p3)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>More consistent presentation has been applied in the final version of the assessment.</p>
<p>G13) General</p> <p>You may wish to consider including an overview of what the key issues are for Swansea. This will help the board members as they reflect on what priorities to focus on in the well-being plan.</p>	<p>Welsh Government (p3)</p>	<p>N / P</p> <p>Comment noted, but this will be taken forward in the next stage of the process (response analysis), including the findings of the research commission.</p>
<p>G14) General</p> <p>Quality of Analytical Approach – In total there were 330 responses to the primary research exercise. Although this is not a huge amount in terms of a quantitative survey, it potentially provides a rich basis for qualitative analysis. Some of the analysis that has been conducted so far is presented quantitatively and with levels of precision (e.g. 40.2% agreed ...) which would imply the survey is representative while this is not necessarily the case. To strengthen the credibility,</p>	<p>Welsh Government (p4 &amp; p6)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>Presentation of this analysis will be amended as appropriate in a revised Annex 1. Further analysis of the survey data, including by community area and age group, has not been pursued at this stage due to limited survey sample sizes and resource constraints. However, public quotes from the survey have been included within the final assessment's topic sections.</p>



<p>we would recommend highlighting that the findings cannot be said to be statistically representative of the wider population, and stating that any quantitative findings from the survey should be treated as indicative only of what the wider population might think, and instead focus on the qualitative intelligence gathered from the survey.</p> <p>We note that further coding and qualitative analysis is being included in the next steps, along with inclusion of illustrative quotations and further breakdowns by community area / age group etc. This approach is encouraging and we expect it will provide a strong basis for a plan that is informed by local engagement and intelligence gathering, coupled with the higher level quantitative analysis.</p> <p>The annex outlines in detail the approach taken to the collection and analysis of evidence and data, but it would be useful to include a short methodology section in the main assessment summarising this information and providing some background to the methods used.</p> <p>In summary, <i>Review the way results of the primary research are presented and focus more on the qualitative rather than the quantitative findings.</i> (WG category B)</p>		
<p>G15) General</p> <p>Quality of Analytical Approach – Overall, the assessment provides a thorough, comprehensive and methodical situation analysis. This can now be</p>	<p>Welsh Government (p4 &amp; p6)</p>	<p>P</p> <p>This will be taken forward in the response analysis stage of the process to inform the well-being plan, which will be initially informed by the Assessment</p>

<p>strengthened by starting the response analysis (“so what does this all mean for Swansea and the communities within it?”) to inform the well-being plan. (WG category B)</p>		<p>and the research commission.</p>
<p>G16) General</p> <p>Future trends – Future trends and prospects for Swansea are included as topics throughout the assessment. However, these sections could be strengthened by including more detail on projections and future trends, although we note this is part of your next steps and you will be using the latest Future Trends Report.</p> <p>In order to strengthen this aspect of the assessment, we would suggest considering the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix and including this in the introduction or early on in the assessment in order to clearly set out issues that need to be monitored, issues that require further research and issues that are critical and need to be prioritised.</p> <p>In summary, <i>Build on the future trends work by including more projections and consider using the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix.</i> (WG category B)</p>	<p>Welsh Government (p5 &amp; p6)</p>	<p>P / A</p> <p>Information from the Future Trends report has informed aspects of this assessment, although not as comprehensively as we would have liked due to resources. We acknowledge this as an issue and are committed to consider future trends more fully during the Well-being Plan process. The use of the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix may be further considered as part of the response analysis stage, to inform the setting of objectives for the well-being plan.</p>
<p>G17) General / multiple chapters</p> <p>The following improvements are suggested:</p> <p>i. An explanation of how topics are chosen for inclusion in the different chapters. It would help to be more explicit about how the Assessment was produced.</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>i. A. We will look to include this information in a new ‘Background’ annex to the main assessment, along with further detail on different aspects of the overall process. However, current chapter introductions also consider this.</p> <p>ii. N. The topic sub-heading ‘Areas for improvement’ also seeks to reflect deficits. Consideration of</p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ii. Less focus on individual projects that are already underway and more focus on the areas where there is little work going on / unmet need. More focus on deficits, tensions and trade-offs, beyond recognising the key challenges being faced.</li> <li>iii. The links to the seven well-being goals of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act could be made explicit and more reference made to national and regional policies and strategies in general (e.g., State of Natural Resources Report, Population Needs Assessment, Local Development Plans).</li> <li>iv. Create links between chapters (e.g. hyperlinks) to avoid duplication and avoid overlap between topic areas within individual chapters.</li> <li>v. Greater consistency between chapters in detailing the level of engagement when producing the Assessment.</li> <li>vi. There are indirect links to mental well-being throughout, it would be helpful to see more explicit focus on this in the document as it is a key issue for the well-being of the population.</li> <li>vii. Often lacking in describing the differences between different communities within the area and their needs. Where there is data there is often limited interpretation of what it means, and limited explanation of statistics such as confidence intervals and statistical significance.</li> <li>viii. Further reference/information on cross-boundary issues.</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>tensions/trade-offs will be an aspect of the analysis commission.</li> <li>iii. A. References to well-being goals and strategies have been included where possible.</li> <li>iv. N. Resource and time constraints limited further consideration. We will look to add hyperlinks to the contents page and chapter introductions.</li> <li>v. N. Considered difficult to implement due to the variety of topics and contributors.</li> <li>vi. N. Mental well-being would have been a topic within the Social chapter if resources were available. Reference to the Population Needs Assessment prepared concurrently is included in the final document.</li> <li>vii. N. The analysis of Community Areas is variable, but this is determined in part by data availability and the perspectives of topic writers.</li> <li>viii. N. Resource and time constraints limited further consideration. However, some sections already consider the regional aspect of topics.</li> <li>ix. P. Refer to previous comments and responses around Future Trends.</li> <li>x. A. This is outlined in the Introduction and additional information will be included in the background annex as far as possible.</li> <li>xi. N / P. Resource and time constraints limited further consideration. However, an easy-read version of the assessment is planned, which will be a resource to inform the well-being plan.</li> <li>xii. N. Limited by resource and time constraints.</li> </ul>
---	--	--

<p>ix. Strengthening the information and interpretation presented on prediction of future trends, particularly in terms of impact on future generations.</p> <p>x. Further information on how the assessment will be used to develop objectives and a subsequent plan.</p> <p>xi. Language could be less technical, possible benefit of summary sections as well as an acronym guide.</p> <p>xii. The use of the well-being goals and ways of working within the legislation could be made more explicit throughout the document, in particular around long-term thinking and prevention.</p>		
<p>G18) General / All chapters</p> <p>None of the members were able to understand it. The assessment should allow people with Learning disabilities to understand it and allow them to have their voices heard.</p>	<p>Survey – Your Voice Advocacy</p>	<p>P</p> <p>We aim to develop an easy-read version of the final assessment, which will support and inform the Well-being Plan process.</p>
<p>G19) General / All chapters</p> <p>Address poor management practices in the public sector</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>G20) General / (Economy &amp; Environment)</p> <p>More green spaces during building projects through the city,</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Provision of green spaces is a key consideration in all recent regeneration developments. A pop up park is planned for Swansea Central area.</p>
<p>G21) General / (Economy &amp; Environment)</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p>

council only using building company within its borders to cut co2 emissions		This would require a change in Council procurement rules which is beyond the scope of this assessment.
G22) General / Environment  Reference/s to natural resources and the risks, impacts and opportunities associated with them across all well-being dimensions could be more spatially specific to better reflect important differences, inequalities, and the range of challenges and responses needed... A particular theme we would encourage the PSB to explore spatially is that of equality of access to and use of high quality, natural green and blue space, and equality of access to active and sustainable travel.	Natural Resources Wales	N  Comment noted, but resource and time constraints limit further consideration. These issues can be considered by the following publication of the Assessment.
G23) General  'Integration' is a Topic sub-heading within each chapter and this has helped raise awareness and focus minds on making linkages within / between chapters and topics. It is recommended that the Assessment and evolving well-being planning process looks builds on these high-level linkages to ensure that well-being is considered 'in the round', key cross-cutting themes are identified, and the ground is paved for meaningful collaboration to tackle issues such as transformation of the food, energy, and transportation systems.	Natural Resources Wales	P  These points will be considered in ongoing discussions in the development of the well-being plan priorities / objectives.
G24) General  The positive reference to beaches and parks / green space as important natural assets for cultural and	Natural Resources Wales	N  Comment noted, but resource and time constraints limited further consideration. These issues, which

<p>economic well-being, particularly tourism, but also as an amenity that innately enhances well-being is welcomed. However, this could be strengthened by considering the risks / challenges and future trends for these assets and knock-on effects (the ‘so what?’) for longer-term and sustainable cultural and economic well-being.</p>		<p>are particularly important in terms of cultural and economic well-being, will now be considered by the following publication of the Assessment.</p>
<p>G25) General</p> <p>In some sections the draft narrative around future trends could be strengthened with reference to the Future Trends Wales report, to draw out and add details across chapters / topics, as are relevant to Swansea.</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>P / A</p> <p>Information from the Future Trends report has informed aspects of this assessment, although not as comprehensively as we would have liked due to resources. However, we acknowledge this as an issue and are committed to consider future trends more fully during the Well-being Plan process. The Introduction pages in the final assessment were amended to reflect this.</p>
<p>G26) General</p> <p>There is opportunity and need to enhance this assessment and its usefulness in informing further discussions through more detailed assessment of potential impacts on key assets, including infrastructure, protected areas/habitats, and communities. This could be done by identifying, as relevant across all four well-being dimensions, those risks which the <i>Climate Change Risk Assessment 3 (CCRA3) Welsh summary report</i> lists as high magnitude and requiring action now, and what they mean for specific communities and aspects of well-being.</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>P</p> <p>Will be considered and inform future discussions.</p>

<p>G27) General</p> <p>Include in the document, where most relevant, responses regarding climate change that were received through well-being assessment survey, engagement activities, and consultation, particularly lived experience.</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>A</p>
<p>G28) General</p> <p>Add / update narrative with reference to the latest findings of the IPCC 6th Assessment report:  <i>“The cumulative scientific evidence is unequivocal: Climate change is a threat to human well-being and planetary health. Any further delay in concerted anticipatory global action on adaptation and mitigation will miss a brief and rapidly closing window of opportunity to secure a liveable and sustainable future for all.”</i>          IPCC Sixth Assessment Report, 2022.</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>A</p>
<p>G29) General / Environment</p> <p>It is recommended to also refer to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Climate and Nature charter</li> <li>• The work Swansea Council is leading, with support from SEF and the WWN task group, and how this work will help to get a fuller picture of how identified impacts will be addressed, and how current policies and strategies link to the ability to manage risks.</li> <li>• It may be that the above warrants the addition of a climate change topic although, ideally, this should be</li> </ul>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>A / P</p>

addressed across and by all dimensions of well-being.		
<p>G30) General</p> <p>The well-being assessment explores inequalities between different demographic groups and communities in Swansea mainly from a social and economic perspective. Although this provides critically important insights, environmental inequalities resulting from different levels of exposure to environmental risks are only partially addressed. The links between all well-being dimensions and their causal relationships on inequalities are not fully considered and therefore remain unclear. A more integrated perspective and understanding of this topic should be developed as this would generate valuable additional insights.</p> <p>Recommendation: Refer to and include, where relevant, findings and recommendations from the FGC for Wales report: <i>Inequality in a Future Wales: Areas for action in work, climate and demographic change</i>. This may help highlight priority areas (topical, socio-economic, spatial) in Swansea for further discussion.</p>	Natural Resources Wales	<p>P</p> <p>This will be considered by the PSB and inform future discussions.</p>
<p>I1) Introduction</p> <p>It is noted the community areas are defined by primary care cluster, which is an important area to consider, given primary care provision is a key issue that has a significant impact on health and wellbeing of the population of Swansea. We would have liked to</p>	Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team	<p>N</p> <p>The Community Areas are defined based on primary care clusters, as in 2017. However, resources were not available to consider primary care provision (e.g. as part of a general health topic) in this assessment. Other geographical areas are considered on the basis</p>



see more information on this aspect addressed in the Assessment. It is also worth considering other geographical areas that are important for well-being planning, in particular the community areas defined within Local Development Plans.		of data availability for the particular topic.
I2) Introduction  It was helpful to see the detail around methods of engagement in Appendix 1, although further detail on the sub-group involved would be useful. Recognising limitations during pandemic, it will be important to consider how we can improve engagement in the future, using the assets of partners in achieving this. More detail on the regional Co-ordination Board would be useful and how engagement has featured as part of this structure.	Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team	A  This information will be considered for inclusion in a new ‘Background’ annex to the main assessment.
I3) Introduction  The introduction is fine but the Chairs Welcome statement really makes clear the current dire context now added to by the crisis in Ukraine	Survey – UNITE Swansea Area Retired Members Branch & National Pensioners Convention Wales	A  Introductory message from the Board now refers to the impact of ‘world geo-political events’.
I4) Introduction  More police involvement	Survey – member of public	N
D1) Demographic Profile  The map and table included on page 10 of the assessment has inconsistent colours, which makes it confusing to read e.g. Bay East is orange on the map,	Welsh Government (p3)	A  Corrected for the final version.

and green in the table. Additionally, it would be helpful if the map could be enlarged to make it easier to read the text and details on the map.		
<p>D2) Demographic Profile</p> <p>This was a useful summary, although it is not always clear how this links to the other chapters and how it will go on to inform the well-being plans. More detail in relation to the different communities which make up Swansea (defined by the primary care clusters in this document) would be useful.</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Comment noted, but resource / time constraints limited further consideration. However, statistical profiles of the Community Areas will be provided in an Annex to highlight basic area characteristics and differences.</p>
<p>D3) Demographic Profile</p> <p>The fact that there will be an increase in the number of people aged 65 and older should not be seen as "a burden" and should be challenged as ageism. Older people make a significant contribution in Swansea in so many ways - including being Income tax &amp; Council Tax payers!</p>	<p>Survey – UNITE Swansea Area Retired Members Branch &amp; National Pensioners Convention Wales</p>	<p>A</p> <p>Minor adjustments made to the section considering population by age.</p>
<p>D4) Demographic Profile</p> <p>p10 need same colours on the map and table (community areas);  p11 why using 2011 ONS statistics for Swansea?;  p11 composition of Swansea population table by sex and age;  p12 population pyramid refers to Swansea by age and gender;  p13 specific cohorts – no mention of 16-19, 60-64, 75-</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>p10 A. Amendment noted and made  p11 A. Population density map updated to 2020 estimates (the latest available)  p11 A. Table title formats standardised  p12 N  p13 N. Not all age cohorts considered due to space, with less significant trends of note in some cases.  p14 N. Age 16-64 remains the standard definition of 'working age' in official statistics.</p>

84; p14 why is working age 16-64 – women work until 67		
D5) Demographic Profile  Too much money spent on town Centre projects	Survey – member of public	N
D6) Demographic Profile  To set the scene and give important context from the start of this key assessment, and as Swansea’s outstanding natural environment is a major part of the county’s identity and a big draw to visitors, a ‘Place Profile’ giving a more detailed overview of landscape and natural assets could be added following the ‘Demographic Profile’ chapter.	Natural Resources Wales	A  Included in final version of Assessment as part of ‘Swansea Profile’.
S1) Social well-being  The subheading ‘adult social care’ is the same as the topic heading ‘social care’. This could be made clearer.	Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p7)	A  The introduction to the ‘Social Care’ topic now notes the sub-topics within. Formatting amended.
S2) Social well-being  ...the ‘Perceptions and perspectives’ section under Children, Young People and Families on p26 mentions evidence collected from members of Swansea Council’s Corporate Parenting Board and Care Experienced Children and Young People since December 2020. It would be useful to provide some additional information on this exercise to emphasise the valuable engagement work that has been undertaken as part of the assessment, and also	Welsh Government (p5)	N / P  Comment noted, but resource / time constraints limited further consideration at this stage. However, we acknowledge this as an issue and will consider further during the Well-being Plan process.

provide some background information for data sources such as the National Survey.		
S3) Social well-being  The assessment is silent on Welsh medium childcare although there is a reference to Welsh medium education. It would benefit from further detail of plans to increase the provision of Welsh medium childcare in the local authority so that there is a clear transition for some children into Welsh medium education.	Welsh Government (p5-6)	N  Comment noted, but resource / time constraints limited further consideration at this stage. We believe that the Council's Childcare and Play Sufficiency Assessments consider this in detail.
S4) Social well-being  There are a broad range of topics covered in this chapter. However, it would be useful to include information on how decisions were reached on which topics were included, and which were not.	Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team	A  The content on the chapter was determined by the information received from partners. We will look to include further information about topic selection in the 'Background' Annex.
S5) Social well-being  There is some overlap between topics within this chapter, for example multiple topic areas cover early years and children and young people. It would be beneficial if there was consolidation of these topic areas or clear links between the different topic areas.	Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team	N  Comment noted, but resource / time constraints limited further consideration at this stage.
S6) Social well-being  It would also be useful if links could be made between topics which may have impact in different chapters of the assessment, for example how wildfires impact environmental well-being.	Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team	A  There is a section on 'Integration' within each topic which is designed to bring these links out, and the research commission aims to develop this further. Specific reference in the wildfires topic to environmental well-being has been added.

<p>S7) Social well-being</p> <p>There are some gaps within the populations included in the chapter. For example, there is a focus on children and young people and older adults, but less focus on the general adult, working-age population. Including information on this population would be beneficial to understanding wider population well-being.</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Comment noted, but resource / time constraints limited further consideration at this stage.</p>
<p>S8) Social well-being</p> <p>On page 28, you have listed services delivered by YMCA for Young Carers, but no list of services provided by Swansea Carers Centre, in this section - they provide crucial services for carers - please can you add them in</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>A</p> <p>The Centre is noted in the assessment and general additional information about their role included.</p>
<p>S9) Social well-being</p> <p>Would have liked to have seen more information on the following addressed in the Assessment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Tobacco control</li> <li>• Chronic disease management</li> <li>• Immunisation.</li> </ul> <p>These are all key issues that can significantly impact the health and wellbeing of the population of Swansea but were either absent from the Assessment or had very limited reference.</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>These issues are important aspects of physical health, which is acknowledged as a gap within the Social chapter. These topics are considered in the Population Needs Assessment, to which reference is made in this chapter.</p>
<p>S10) Social well-being</p> <p>Would have liked to have seen more detail and links</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>These issues are important aspects of physical</p>

<p>made to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The importance of addressing health and wellbeing in the early years</li> <li>• The Healthy Weight Healthy Wales Strategy</li> <li>• The importance of green spaces (for example, how this links to mental health and positive wellbeing in Swansea)</li> <li>• Substance misuse (including alcohol use). These topics were covered in the assessment but could benefit from further detail.</li> </ul>		<p>health, which is acknowledged as a gap within the Social chapter. However, the contribution of green spaces to well-being is noted in the Managing Green Infrastructure and Placemaking topic (Environment), and substance misuse features in the Social chapter. Some of these topics would also be featured in the separate Population Needs Assessment.</p>
<p>S11) Social well-being</p> <p>There is strong evidence that older people are becoming more Socially isolated and are very nervous about resuming contact etc. Recent events may well accelerate the need to develop proper, green energy powered public transport which will be challenging for a Urban rural City like Swansea but it also offers opportunities for employment and the local development of appropriate technologies. We would strongly support the steering group taking on the role of Ageing Well Champions provided that is done in a truly inclusive and open manner. We support the comments on the risks of digital exclusion.</p>	<p>Survey – UNITE Swansea Area Retired Members Branch &amp; National Pensioners Convention Wales</p>	<p>P</p> <p>Comments noted, and will be considered further during the Well-being Plan process.</p>
<p>S12) Social well-being</p> <p>Support the Chapters on Housing, Poverty &amp; Crime and Safety</p>	<p>Survey – UNITE Swansea Area Retired Members Branch &amp; National Pensioners Convention Wales</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>S13) Social well-being</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p>

<p>Life expectancy is 77 years for Swansea males , but council retirement age is now 66 , do you think it's fair to spend only 11 years in retirement</p>		
<p>S14) Social well-being</p> <p>p17 stage of the pandemic;  p22 suggest a model of assisted living around green spaces/growing spaces;  p30 carers must be paid a salary that enable them to live a good life;  p34 bottom chart needs an explanation. It is not clear what it means;  p42 it has exacerbated;  p43 how was 50* consultation carried out in August and September 2021? I didn't see it;  p45 Ageing well section is repetitive in several places;  p48 weekly earnings last column, Swansea (workplace) not clear what that means;  p62 line justification is not working at bottom of page;  p63 people sleeping rough table - confusing actual vs. estimated - I don't understand why need estimated;  p70 need greater percentage of affordable housing;  p87 as an improvement, could Swansea become the social eating capital of Wales? My vision for the city centre - all restaurants and cafes selling healthy local, seasonal, high quality, nutrient dense food; need council and business support for Bwyd Abertawe and Swansea becoming a Sustainable Food Places network member; I wanted to know more about diets, food,</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>A / N / P</p> <p>The assessment chapter was reviewed in light of these comments and updated where possible and appropriate.</p> <p>Some of the comments are considered more policy-related and appropriate for consideration during the Well-being Plan process.</p>

<p>diet-related no communicable diseases and plans for changing food environments to make healthy food the easy choice, and facilitating behaviour change on healthy regenerative local, seasonal and nutrient dense food choices; need people care permaculture ethic prioritised</p>		
<p>S15) Social well-being</p> <p>It is particularly heartening to see that young people (in response to a consultation exercise) have as their number one priority, 'Protecting the Environment and Green Spaces' (ref Social Chapter, Listening to Children and Young People: Perceptions and Perspectives); it will be paramount to ensure these conversations are continued with support for YP to be involved in decision-making about their future in Swansea particularly around this theme. Perhaps the PSB's Human Rights City Steering Group may be in a position to take this forward?</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>N / P</p> <p>Comments noted, and to be considered further during the Well-being Plan process.</p>
<p>S16) Social well-being</p> <p>Due to the acknowledged gap on (mental and physical) health in the Social section, there has not been opportunity to identify and discuss the significant links between health and natural resources, particularly active travel, air and water quality, access to green and blue space, flood risk, GI, etc... although there is mention of these associations within topics under the Environment chapter. We would welcome opportunity to work with PSB partners to input to health topics</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>P</p> <p>Comment noted, but resource and time constraints limited further amendments. This will be considered further during the Well-being Plan process.</p>



<p>and/or provide some narrative to acknowledge these important links and commit to exploring them in the development of objective and priority setting for the Well-being Plan.</p> <p>Recommendation: Include narrative and refs to case studies / relevant research and policy on links between health and natural resources, and nature-based solutions for health and well-being.</p>		
<p>EC1) Economic well-being</p> <p><b>Skills for the future</b> – There is good information contained within the ‘Swansea’s workforce’ section and it’s positive to hear the Council and its local/regional partners are working to create a more skilled workforce in the future... we encourage you to consider the findings in our recent <a href="#">report</a> on the skills needed to transition to a low carbon economy. It finds that across Wales there are significant skills gaps in green industries which must be addressed.</p> <p>This could be explored further within the ‘Future trends and prospects for Swansea’ area of the ‘Swansea workforce’ section and in relation to the discussion of school attainment and training and education provision in the region. Clear links should also be made to your local Regional Skills Partnership.</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p5)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>As noted in the chapter, the Skills and Talent programme under the City Deal is the lead for addressing skills gaps. The text has been updated.</p> <p>The Green Infrastructure (GI) strategy is also noted with reference to training for GI.</p>
<p>EC2) Economic well-being</p> <p>The link between income and wellbeing is well</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Comment noted, but resource / time constraints</p>

<p>established. The chapter contains a lot of useful data. However, it doesn't often specify the differences between population subgroups within Swansea. In particular, the differences between areas and communities, now and in the future. Where data isn't available, this could be speculated on. The section on educational attainment is a good example of where differences between population subgroups are well covered. It would be useful to see more interpretation of what the data is telling us about the well-being needs of the population.</p>		<p>limited further consideration at this stage.</p>
<p>EC3) Economic well-being</p> <p>There is a lot of focus on current strengths and assets (e.g. projects already underway). It would be helpful to know more about where the deficits are and any tensions and challenges to improving wellbeing in these areas.</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>The projects underway are addressing known deficits by creating more density in the city centre (people living and working), in order to generate footfall to support businesses and economic well-being.</p> <p>Improvement areas including deficits are already noted in topic sections, e.g. productivity.</p>
<p>EC4) Economic well-being</p> <p>Climate change and rising sea levels represent the biggest challenges and again external events are driving the need to develop green and self sufficient energy, not to rely on world markets</p>	<p>Survey – UNITE Swansea Area Retired Members Branch &amp; National Pensioners Convention Wales</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Renewable energy is a key mission in the Regional Economic Delivery plan.</p> <p>Reference to the regional energy strategy is already made in the introduction to the Economic chapter.</p>
<p>EC5) Economic well-being</p> <p>p104 why do we need smart agriculture - this is</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>A / N</p> <p>The assessment chapter was reviewed in light of</p>

<p>industrial agriculture, the wrong paradigm!;</p> <p>p113 GVA section is repetitive to earlier section in Swansea economic infrastructure;</p> <p>p120 why working age is 16-64 when women retire at 67?; let's have the pilot for UBI in Swansea;</p> <p>p128 if Swansea is a Sustainable Food Place, that would improve the local food economy; need doughnut economics for Swansea and refer to bioregions; need permaculture fair share ethic prioritised</p>		<p>these comments and updated where possible and appropriate.</p>
<p>EC6) Economic well-being</p> <p>Spend money on developing the tidal lagoon</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Tidal energy is being taken forward by the Eden project which is private sector led and is referred to in the Economic well-being chapter.</p>
<p>EC7) Economic well-being</p> <p>Recommended additional narrative around the Circular Economy, Covid-19, and Swansea Bay City Deal projects that contribute to the low carbon / net zero ambitions of the region.</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Comment noted, but resource and time constraints limited further amendments.</p>
<p>EN1) Environmental well-being</p> <p>Net Zero: The environment chapter refers to Welsh Government's Low Carbon Delivery Plan (Prosperity for All, 2019). Please note, this document has been updated and replaced with 'Net Zero'.</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p8)</p>	<p>A</p>
<p>EN2) Environmental well-being</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner</p>	<p>A</p>

Reference not included properly on page 151.	for Wales (p8)	
<p>EN3) Environmental well-being</p> <p>There is a mixture of quantitative and qualitative data summarising environmental well-being and good references to environmental well-being integrated into the cultural chapter as well. There is also reference to the intrinsic connection between people, our health and well-being which is welcomed. There are useful and informative references to school settings, as well as useful reference to active travel and green infrastructure, food and climate change, food poverty, and food production, all of which will have clear impacts on the health and well-being of the population of Swansea. However, these topics are not necessarily linked to health throughout the assessment which would provide further context and richer detail on the well-being of the local population.</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Health is mentioned consistently throughout Environment chapter.</p> <p>It is intended that integration between dimensions and topics, including environment and health, will be further highlighted and expanded on within the response analysis informed by the academic research commission.</p>
<p>EN4) Environmental well-being</p> <p>There is limited reference to physical health as well as mental health and well-being, and limited detail on the range of direct and indirect health impacts from climate change. There are some policies / areas which aren't clearly referenced and further detail on these areas would be welcomed, including Net Zero and local development planning policy</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>A</p> <p>Amendments made to include impacts of climate change on food and health.</p> <p>As acknowledged in the Assessment introduction, there are gaps in the Social chapter giving limited opportunity to discuss in greater depth the impacts of climate change on physical and mental health. However, high-level references are made to wider impacts of climate change (e.g. flood risk, food) on health in the Environment chapter, and these issues</p>

		will be discussed in the development of the Well-being Plan priorities.
<p>EN5) Environmental well-being</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• See comments on economic well-being! But very supportive of the Chapter.</li> <li>• How will Swansea Resist external purchasing of land for corporate green wash tree planting?</li> <li>• We would question the statement "Bus network coverage across Swansea is generally good".</li> <li>• We strongly support the comment "Transport should be regarded as a universal basic service - like healthcare and education. Free or low cost public transport is central to the vision of a healthier, more equal, more prosperous Wales and achieving our climate emergency commitments."</li> </ul>	<p>Survey – UNITE Swansea Area Retired Members Branch &amp; National Pensioners Convention Wales</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• N</li> <li>• N. During the development of the assessment no concerns on this issue were raised specifically about land in Swansea. We believe that the issue of (external) purchase of land is something that Welsh Government is looking to address.</li> <li>• N. The statement is subjective, and it is accepted that there may be differing views on this issue.</li> <li>• N</li> </ul>
<p>EN6) Environmental well-being</p> <p>p131 and p132 highlighting food is important - need to emphasise how it is grown and processed, ideally to optimise healthy biomes;</p> <p>p133 Table x (needs a number) for a summary of resilience;</p> <p>p134 GI section (pxx);</p> <p>p135 need to link to green prescribing, article by Michele Howarth et al (2020), also connections to soil health, regenerative agriculture to food quality and human health. Why not declare a health emergency?</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>A / N</p> <p>The assessment chapter was reviewed in light of these comments and updated where possible and appropriate. We welcome a thoughtful and thorough response to the draft assessment.</p> <p>Comments on specific points are noted below:  p131/132 – N. In these paragraphs reference to food and other systems is high level.  p133 – A  p134 – A</p>

<p>diet-related noncommunicable disease prevalances are worsening!;</p> <p>p136 myco-remediation of contaminated soils;</p> <p>p137 why is Table x inserted several pages after when it was first mentioned? need a permaculture approach to design. What is fenceless fencing? stop using glyphosate, what is a Sustainable Farming scheme?;</p> <p>p136 refer to the hydrological cycle of Walter Jehne - the soil carbon sponge. Stop using toxic chemicals and synthetic fertilisers, use mob grazing, regenerative agriculture, agroecology (urban, peri-urban, fringe and rural), link between soil health and food quality based on nutrient density;</p> <p>p139 need regenerative agriculture to increase water holding capacity of soil to replenish the aquifers. Nutrient dense food can improve soil structure and water holding capacity;</p> <p>p140 where are sections b and d below. Table X. why is faecal material running into Swansea Bay - this is atrocious?;</p> <p>p141 why nitrification? need to change to Regenerative agriculture and agroecology as no toxic chemicals are used. just need to increase soil organic matter, improve soil structure and water holding capacity;</p> <p>p142 why soil loss? transition to Regenerative Agriculture. Table X above. do mycoremediation for polluted land. Why sewerage is being discharged into Swansea Bay - this is atrocious?; *Note should be at the bottom of the page. Clear stream year Ref TBC.</p>		<p>p135 – A. Green prescribing reference now included</p> <p>p136 – N</p> <p>p137 – A. Table moved / fenceless fencing explained</p> <p>p139 – A. Noted in Water Resources and Soils/Food</p> <p>p140 – A. Further information regarding bathing water and recent improvements is available in NRW 2022 <a href="#">Bathing Water Profile for Swansea Bay</a>.</p> <p>p141 – A. Some amendments made. Nitrification occurs because of fertilisers (phosphorus and other nutrients) being washed into water bodies through run-off as a result of land management practices within the catchment (particularly farmed land), as well as from other discharges.</p> <p>p142 – A</p> <p>p143 – A</p> <p>p144 – N (covered in Land use, soils and food topic)</p> <p>p149 – A</p> <p>p150/151 – A. References added</p> <p>p152 – N (taken from SoNaRR 2020)</p> <p>p153 – A. Reference added, and amended text re-nutrient dense food, less food loss / waste</p> <p>p155 – A. Text amended (re- SFP)</p> <p>p156/157 – A</p> <p>p158 – A. Added ref to 20-minute neighbourhood</p> <p>p159 – N (carbon sequestration already mentioned)</p> <p>p162 – N</p> <p>p170 – N</p> <p>P172 – N</p> <p>p174 – N. Reference is already made to WG’s ‘My Recycling Wales’ website, which gives specific info by</p>
--	--	---

<p>Why is sewerage being discharged into water and why is their poor water quality?</p> <p>p143 no need for soil erosion - keep soil covered with a living root;</p> <p>p144 need Regenerative agriculture and agroecology to improve soil quality;</p> <p>p149 need agroecology mentioned as an approach;</p> <p>p150 use regenerative agriculture not sustainable farming. Non-market goods - better population health from high quality nutrient dense food;</p> <p>p150 reference needed for reduction in application of fertilisers;</p> <p>p151 need 1200 group reference;</p> <p>p152 biggest threat to soils is industrial agriculture. reference needed for reduction in agricultural land area. reference needed in relation to soils and plant growth. needs to be land management practices are driving climate change through damage to hydrological cycle;</p> <p>p153 need better quality nutrient dense food produced by regenerative agriculture/agroecological practices for healthier people. Nutrient dense food with a high brix has less food loss and less food waste. integrating agroecology - nature-friendly practices. silvopasture, smaller diversified mixed farms. use permaculture design and ecological principles and practices; p153 to tackle climate change emergency - reference needed;</p> <p>p154 smallscale agroecological growing. also need research on growing nutrient dense food that also</p>		<p>local authority on where / how waste is treated</p> <p>P178/179 – N (refer to comments above).</p>
---	--	---

<p>sequesters more carbon. take an ecosystem approach;  p155 designation of Swansea as a Sustainable Food Place (Bwyd Abertawe) to co-design a better food system that works for people and Nature. include nutrition security and population health. need to mention planetary boundaries. Right to Nutritious Food not just right to food. link to diet-related noncommunicable diseases. Also, the 4th region south west Wales food system conference report recommendations;  p156 wellbeing typo;  p157 Berlin typo. regenerating our typo;  p158 growing food spaces in planning. Biophilia. 20 minute neighbourhood;  p159 increase carbon sequestration. increase nutrient dense food for healthy people. up-to-date data on quantity and quality of GI; p160 m<sup>3</sup> (3 superscript);  p161 NO<sub>2</sub> (2 subscript);  p162 reduce ammonia by extensive cattle grazing. 100% pasture fed livestock;  p170 need more buses in the evening;  p172 Swansea airport needs to be regenerated;  p174 how is Swansea collected material for recycling and composting dealt with and where?;  p178 eradicating avoidable food waste - grow nutrient dense food!;  p179 change to regenerative agriculture/agroecology to grow nutrient dense food and increase carbon sequestration. tackling typo. several words missing; need earth care permaculture ethic prioritised</p>		
--	--	--



<p>EN7) Environmental well-being</p> <p>Too many new homes built without solar or heat pumps</p> <p>Make all builders comply and have 3 parking spaces per home - most new sites only allow for 2</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p> <p>There are a growing number of local initiatives led by public bodies and housing associations that incorporate renewable energy generation into housing developments in line with the direction of national and local policies.</p> <p>Along with this government bodies and housing associations are considering reducing rather than increasing space for private cars in response to prioritising and encouraging more sustainable travel options in light of the climate emergency.</p>
<p>EN8) Environmental well-being / General</p> <p>Provide support for Bwyd Abertawe to become a Sustainable Food Place to improve health and wellbeing and economy and livelihoods of people living in Swansea; there needs to be greater emphasis on food, changing the food environments to healthy; ensuring local, fresh, short, seasonal, regenerative, high quality, nutrient dense food supply chains; increasing access to land for regenerative agriculture/agroecology; prioritising local and nutrient dense food for dynamic food procurement; support fringe farming of high quality nutrient dense food; resist temptation to support hydroponics - it is greenwashing from BigAg!</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p> <p>It is considered that this is largely already covered in the assessment. Also refer to comments above.</p>
<p>EN9) Environmental well-being</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>N / P</p>

<p>If timings allow, it would be good to include any feedback from NRW and WG's Natur a Ni project that has been received from people living / working in Swansea.</p>		<p>The raw data from Natur a Ni project will not be available until after the publication of the WBA, but may be considered in ongoing discussions.</p>
<p>C1) Cultural well-being</p> <p>Text for 'insert image' remains on page 201.</p>	<p>Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (p8)</p>	<p>A</p> <p>Image now included.</p>
<p>C2) Cultural well-being</p> <p>We would recommend starting the document with this chapter or introducing it earlier in the document. The assessment is very lengthy, and this chapter could help to keep readers engaged. The data included reflects the area well and there is a good reflection on the variety of communities and their needs.</p>	<p>Survey – Swansea Bay Public Health Team</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Comment noted and welcomed. However, the order of the chapters are unchanged.</p>
<p>C3) Cultural well-being</p> <p>p185 need reference for NZ ministry for culture and heritage definition;</p> <p>p201 insert image DMP;</p> <p>p203 more gardeners involved in building activities;</p> <p>p209 need to mention food for health. Food as Medicine;</p> <p>p211 Develop skills for life - need food literacy;</p> <p>p214 Croeso Food and drink stalls, cookery demonstration (bilingual) - did they use local Nutrient dense food?;</p> <p>p217 Swansea is signed up - typo;</p> <p>p223 need funding for community groups. Very reliant</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>p185 – A. Specific publication reference added</p> <p>p201 – A</p> <p>p203 – P</p> <p>p209 – N. Food and health issues are to some extent raised in the Environment and Social chapters</p> <p>p211 – P</p> <p>p214 – N. Note: Croeso attracted 15 food and drink producers, all of them were from Wales, 6 from Swansea, the others from Pembrokeshire, Ceredigion, Newport and Neath Port Talbot. The condition to attend was that they needed to sell Welsh produce or be a Welsh trader. This also applied to craft and trade stalls. The event also works with the Swansea Market team to encourage</p>

<p>on volunteers; p224 for community building grow vegetables and fresh food can be grown for food banks in community buildings</p>		<p>spectators into the market with the cookery demonstration area and a timetable of activities within the market. Of the 13 chefs providing cookery demos, 11 lived in Wales and all used local Welsh produce in their recipes, many purchased ingredients direct from Swansea Market. p217 – A p223 – P. For consideration as part of the Well-being Plan process p224 – P. For consideration as part of the Well-being Plan process.</p>
<p>C4) Cultural well-being</p> <p>Too central for most of our public, culture should be for the whole of our city not just the few who can afford to visit and park in the high cost car parks</p>	<p>Survey – member of public</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Cultural well-being covers a vast amount of topics which take place across the city, for example the Sport &amp; Health service delivers activities throughout Swansea. Schemes such as Fusion work to make cultural accessible to all and has included subsidised/free transport.</p>
<p>C5) Cultural well-being</p> <p>We support this chapter and welcome recent developments in Swansea</p>	<p>Survey – UNITE Swansea Area Retired Members Branch &amp; National Pensioners Convention Wales</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>C6) Cultural well-being</p> <p>In the Cultural chapter, p.197, it is noted that “Swansea’s key strength is its unique mix of city, coast and country offer within one destination. With award winning and globally recognised beaches, parks with</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Comments noted, but resource and time constraints limited further amendments.</p>

<p>green flag status and Britain’s first Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, it is important to recognise the vital role the natural environment plays in boosting residents and visitors wellbeing.”</p> <p>Recommendation: The above statement to acknowledge that Swansea’s natural resources and resilience are at risk from overuse, the climate and nature emergencies, and these risks are likely to become more challenging to address if not done so now, impacting the sustainability of the tourism offer and benefits to local economic wellbeing.</p>		
<p>C7) Cultural well-being</p> <p>Suggested improvements to the section relating to the impact of climate change on cultural heritage assets.</p>	<p>Natural Resources Wales</p>	<p>N</p> <p>Comments noted, but resource and time constraints limited further amendments.</p>

## Appendix 1: Questionnaire for Consultation Draft and Results Summary

This section contains a copy of the survey questionnaire which was used during the consultation on the draft assessment. This appendix also contains information not otherwise included within Section 2 of this report ‘Feedback and Responses’.

### Swansea Public Services Board – Draft Assessment of Local Well-being 2022

Swansea Public Services Board has prepared a draft Assessment of Local Well-being. This evidence base will be used to develop Swansea’s 2023 Local Well-being Plan. The Well-being of Future Generations Act sets out how Swansea Public Services Board works with partners and citizens to improve quality of life in Swansea.

This survey builds on engagement earlier in the process which aimed to understand what well-being meant to people in Swansea.

However, due to the impact of COVID-19 on all public services, there are significant gaps within this draft Assessment of Local Well-being. In particular, the development of content and analysis in relation to social well-being has been impacted.

Please read the draft Assessment and share your views. This feedback will be used to prepare a final version of the Assessment for publication.

The closing date for the consultation is Friday 18 March 2022.

Q1	Are you ...	
	8 (66.7%) A member of the public	2 (16.7%) A third sector organisation/partner organisation (please write in)
	1 (8.3%) A council employee	0 (0.0%) A private sector organisation/partner organisation (please write in)
	0 (0.0%) An elected member	1 (8.3%) Other (please write in)
	0 (0.0%) A PSB partner (please write in)	

Thinking about the Draft Swansea Assessment of Local Well-being’s content:

Q2 Do you have any comments regarding the content of the Introduction?

- Q3 Do you have any comments regarding the content of the ‘Swansea: Demographic Profile’ Chapter?
- Q4 Do you have any comments regarding the content of the Social well-being Chapter?
- Q5 Do you have any comments regarding the content of the Economic well-being Chapter?
- Q6 Do you have any comments regarding the content of the Environmental well-being Chapter?
- Q7 Do you have any comments regarding the content of the Cultural well-being Chapter?
- Q8 Is there any additional information about well-being in Swansea that would be useful to include in the draft Assessment?

Please be aware that an additional chapter has been commissioned, which will draw together the key issues and links across the draft Assessment.

Q9 Thinking about the overall document’s presentation, to what extent do you agree or disagree with the following statements:

	Strongly agree	Tend to agree	Neither agree nor disagree	Tend to disagree	Strongly disagree	Don’t know
The draft Assessment is easy to read and understand	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	3 (37.5%)	1 (12.5%)	1 (12.5%)	0 (0.0%)
I could find information about a topic easily	1 (12.5%)	3 (37.5%)	1 (12.5%)	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	0 (0.0%)
The draft Assessment is too technical	1 (11.1%)	5 (55.6%)	2 (22.2%)	1 (11.1%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)
The draft Assessment met my needs	0 (0.0%)	3 (37.5%)	2 (25.0%)	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	0 (0.0%)
The draft Assessment has improved my understanding of the state of well-being in Swansea	0 (0.0%)	4 (50.0%)	1 (12.5%)	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	0 (0.0%)

Q10 Please explain what improvements could be made

- An Easy Read version
- it's so long for people to read and understand
- The following improvements are suggested: •An explanation of how topics are chosen for inclusion in the different chapters. It would help to be more explicit about how the Assessment was produced. •Less focus on individual projects that are already underway and more focus on the areas where there is little work going on / unmet need. More focus on deficits, tensions and trade-offs, beyond recognising the key challenges being faced. •The links to the seven well-being goals of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act could be made explicit and more reference made to national and regional policies and strategies in general (e.g., State of Natural Resources Report, Population Needs Assessment, Local Development Plans). •Create links between chapters (e.g. hyperlinks) to avoid duplication and avoid overlap between topic areas within individual chapters. •Greater consistency between chapters in detailing the level of engagement when producing the Assessment. •There are indirect links to mental well-being throughout, it would be helpful to see more explicit focus on this in the document as it is a key issue for the well-being of the population. •Often lacking in describing the differences between different communities within the area and their needs. Where there is data there is often limited interpretation of what it means, and limited explanation of statistics such as confidence intervals and statistical significance. •Further reference/information on cross-boundary issues. • Strengthening the information and interpretation presented on prediction of future trends, particularly in terms of impact on future generations. •Further information on how the assessment will be used to develop objectives and a subsequent plan. •Language could be less technical, possible benefit of summary sections as well as an acronym guide. •The use of the well-being goals and ways of working within the legislation could be made more explicit throughout the document, in particular around long-term thinking and prevention.
- The overall document was very good, it was clear and very easy to read although I did find some of the chapters too long but this was probably necessary to cover all aspects.
- Too long a read
- Use better management practices.

Swansea Public Services Board will be using the Assessment to develop our next Local Well-Being Plan 2023-2028.

Q11 Based on the evidence within the draft Assessment, what key themes do you think we should focus on to improve well-being in Swansea?

- Being inclusive and allowing full accessibility of all things.
- Climate Change, Public Transport, Convincing the Public that we can make a difference
- Crime and disorder is killing community with people afraid to leave their homes in parts of our city, drugs are rife in areas such as Clase, Penlan, Sketty Park, Morryston. Do more or let these areas get worse.
- Ones involving better management practices in the sector public
- Social Carer - supporting carers better, support, respite, assessments
- Social Wellbeing is probably the most important and impinges on other themes. The amount of pages given to the various criteria within this theme backs this up.
- This document covers many important issues and there are many individual issues which will impact, either positively or negatively, on others so it is hard to estimate where the most benefit lies. Overall, it is important to focus on the wider determinants of well-being and factors which lie beyond the control of individuals and promote equity in health and wellbeing. Other important things to consider: • Taking a holistic view of the range of issues affecting communities in Swansea when deciding on next steps. • Considering the wide range of data that has been gathered to create this Assessment alongside responses from engagement with stakeholders, partners and the community, when deciding on the key themes and next steps. • Considering which topics will have a long-term impact and lasting benefits for the population.



## Appendix 2: Welsh Government Response

17<sup>th</sup> March 2022

### **Welsh Government response to the consultation on the draft assessment of local well-being for Swansea, required by the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act.**

Thank you for sight of Swansea PSB's Assessment of Local Well-being.

Welsh Government acknowledges that the preparation of an assessment and the supporting evidence is a significant undertaking and recognises the amount of work that has been accomplished. Covid-19 has brought huge challenges to the public sector and PSB partners have demonstrated real dedication and resolve in overcoming some truly testing situations over this period. PSBs are demonstrating that they too have a crucial role to play in the recovery from the pandemic, in considering the social, economic, environmental and cultural impacts on communities and co-ordinating the longer-term response. Given all of this, we also recognise that the assessments have been prepared during extraordinary circumstances and this has been taken into consideration when reviewing them.

Our focus has been on the main areas we consider will go towards providing you with a comprehensive view of the state of well-being in your area, ultimately equipping you with a good, clear understanding of the sort of priorities you as a PSB can target your collective efforts to best effect on in your well-being plan. These are the second round of assessments and it is hoped that there will be lessons learned from the first iteration, building on what happened previously.

We have structured our response to the consultation on your assessment in the same way as in 2017 which is as follows:

- **General comments** providing an overview of thoughts on the assessment;
- More **specific comments** on the way in which the analysis has been undertaken and presented and the way in which the statutory requirements have been met;
- A **final summary table** which identifies the areas we would suggest could benefit from further development. We are adopting a consistent approach to these matters which have been categorised as follows:
  - **Category A** – these are significant issues which we would hope would be addressed prior to publication of the well-being assessment. They might relate, for example, to compliance with the statutory requirements or a fundamental issue with the quality of the analysis
  - **Category B** – these are matters which are important and would support a better informed well-being plan and we would hope could be addressed alongside the development of the plan
  - **Category C** – these are matters which would strengthen the assessment but could be addressed over time.

We will be using the same approach in responding to each of the assessments.

## **Overall Thoughts**

This assessment demonstrates clearly the commitment that Swansea PSB has made to embrace the challenge of assessing well-being in the area. It engages well with the key areas identified in the statutory and non-statutory guidance and demonstrates good use of a range of evidence to support the analysis. The assessment is very comprehensive and we recognise the amount of time and effort that has gone into this. The work that has been done provides a strong foundation to build on.

Our evaluation identifies some areas for further development which, if addressed could strengthen the assessment. These include more of an attempt to interpret what the data means for well-being and public services in Swansea and its communities (i.e. the response analysis), and also demonstrating a greater emphasis on the communities that have been identified and the differences that exist between them.

## **Comments on particular aspects of the Assessment**

### **Statutory Requirements**

The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act (WFG Act) specifies a number of areas that the assessment must cover. This assessment appears to cover some, but not all, of the statutory requirements contained in the WFG Act.

The assessment is based around the same six community areas that were used in the 2017 well-being assessment. The introduction briefly sets out the community areas and they are occasionally referenced in parts of the assessment; however, we would like to see a lot more analysis broken down by these areas throughout the analysis and any differences or similarities between the community areas highlighted. By assessing the well-being of each community, it gives a better understanding of the diversity of the PSB area, and how the varying characteristics of each community impact on well-being, which in turn, helps determine the priorities. It would also be useful to include more background information on the community areas in the introduction, for example an overview of their key characteristics and features, in order to give the reader a better sense of the area and its geography.

The National Indicators have been referenced throughout the assessment, along with the statutory assessments and reviews which the WFG Act specifies the board must consider when preparing the well-being assessment.

## **Structure and Format**

The assessment follows a very clear structure. We particularly like the way topics are set out under the headings 'strengths and assets', 'changes over time', 'comparisons with other places', 'differences within Swansea', 'perceptions and perspectives', 'future trends and prospects' and 'conclusions and key messages'. Overall, this makes the assessment easy to read and the 'return to contents' function included in the footnote allows easy navigation through the document – something we haven't seen in other assessments.

The introduction provides a good overview of the assessment and how you have approached the various aspects of it. The demographic profile gives the reader a useful insight into the area which is particularly helpful for those who may not be familiar with it.

There is a good use of a range of tables and figures that are clearly explained and signposted throughout the assessment. However, it is important to ensure that they are consistently presented and include a title, an x and y label, and the data source.

One small, but important, observation we noted was that the map and table included on page 10 of the assessment has inconsistent colours, which makes it confusing to read e.g. Bay East is orange on the map, and green in the table. Additionally, it would be helpful if the map could be enlarged to make it easier to read the text and details on the map.

The use of case-studies throughout the assessment is effective to support analyses and highlight key areas of interest.

Finally, you may wish to consider including an overview of what the key issues are for Swansea. This will help the board members as they reflect on what priorities to focus on in the well-being plan.

## **Engagement**

It is clear that the PSB has set out to achieve meaningful engagement and involvement (as detailed in the accompanying annex), which aims to ensure that gaps are identified, seldom-heard voices considered and the perspective of citizens included. It is encouraging that all partners have been involved in the engagement exercise and that there has been collaboration with Neath Port Talbot PSB and West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board. Your upfront acknowledgement of the difficulties with engagement faced as a result of Covid-19 also makes for a more credible assessment.

## **Balance and Comprehensiveness**

The assessment is well-balanced and has been structured into chapters covering the four pillars of well-being. It is noticeable however that social well-being contains the most analysis – despite also acknowledging the evidence gaps in relation to health and social well-being due to the Covid-19 pandemic.

It is good to see that culture has received a fair amount of focus, following the last round of assessments, where overall it was found that culture wasn't given as much attention as the other three themes.

An analysis of Swansea as a whole is covered, with good comparison with the rest of Wales.

Overall, the assessment is very comprehensive and covers a wide range of areas, which provides a really good starting point for understanding what the issues are.

## **Reflective and Critical Approach**

One of the positive aspects of the assessment is that overall it adopts an honest and reflective approach throughout. Each topic clearly sets out notes on the evidence source, their strengths and limitations, any inconsistencies or contradictions between them, and gaps / further research required. This provides an impressive systematic approach to the chapters and provides real credibility to the assessment.

## **Quality of Analytical Approach**

The assessment draws on a broad range of evidence and data to provide a thorough and comprehensive situation analysis.

In total there were 330 responses to the primary research exercise. Although this is not a huge amount in terms of a quantitative survey, it potentially provides a rich basis for qualitative analysis. Some of the analysis that has been conducted so far is presented quantitatively and with levels of precision (e.g. 40.2% agreed ...) which would imply the survey is representative while this is not necessarily the case. To strengthen the credibility, we would recommend highlighting that the findings cannot be said to be statistically representative of the wider population, and stating that any quantitative findings from the survey should be treated as indicative only of what the wider population might think, and instead focus on the qualitative intelligence gathered from the survey.

We note that further coding and qualitative analysis is being included in the next steps, along with inclusion of illustrative quotations and further breakdowns by

community area / age group etc. This approach is encouraging and we expect it will provide a strong basis for a plan that is informed by local engagement and intelligence gathering, coupled with the higher level quantitative analysis.

The annex outlines in detail the approach taken to the collection and analysis of evidence and data, but it would be useful to include a short methodology section in the main assessment summarising this information and providing some background to the methods used. For example, the assessment usefully draws on data from the National Survey for Wales in several chapters and the 'Perceptions and perspectives' section under Children, Young People and Families on p26 mentions evidence collected from members of Swansea Council's Corporate Parenting Board and Care Experienced Children and Young People since December 2020. It would be useful to provide some additional information on this exercise to emphasise the valuable engagement work that has been undertaken as part of the assessment, and also provide some background information for data sources such as the National Survey.

Overall, the assessment provides a thorough, comprehensive and methodical situation analysis. This can now be strengthened by starting the response analysis ("so what does this all mean for Swansea and the communities within it?") to inform the well-being plan.

### **Future Trends**

Future trends and prospects for Swansea are included as topics throughout the assessment. However, these sections could be strengthened by including more detail on projections and future trends, although we note this is part of your next steps and you will be using the latest Future Trends Report.

In order to strengthen this aspect of the assessment, we would suggest considering the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix and including this in the introduction or early on in the assessment in order to clearly set out issues that need to be monitored, issues that require further research and issues that are critical and need to be prioritised.

### **Feedback from other policy areas**

Based on the feedback we have received from policy specialists across the Welsh Government, there are some very specific areas which we highlight for your consideration. For example:

- The assessment is silent on Welsh medium childcare although there is a reference to Welsh medium education. It would benefit from further detail of

plans to increase the provision of Welsh medium childcare in the local authority so that there is a clear transition for some children into Welsh medium education.

- The assessment claims to embed poverty at the heart of its policies and this is apparent from the consideration of these issues throughout. It considers employment, living wage, data and digital poverty, child poverty, housing, fuel, race, religion and age as part of the poverty agenda.
- It feels like Swansea have considered the broad range of well-being across the area. Certainly when it comes to the 'early years', they have included strong information about how their work integrates with the broader economic, social and environmental well-being of their communities. And how it compares across the region.
- From a climate change perspective, the assessment is good. It has attempted to look at all aspects of well-being with the environment and climate as a central consideration.
- In terms of crime and policing, the assessment gives a good view of different types of offending behaviours and moreover considers the factors which drive offending behaviour under the 'street vulnerability' heading.

### **Areas for development**

<b>Category A</b>
<p><b>Category B</b></p> <p>More attempt to incorporate the response analysis (see 'Quality of Analytical Approach' paragraph).</p> <p>More attempt to compare and contrast the community areas (see 'Statutory Requirements' paragraph).</p> <p>Build on the future trends work by including more projections and consider using the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix (see Future Trends' paragraph).</p> <p>Review the way results of the primary research are presented and focus more on the qualitative rather than the quantitative findings (see 'Quality of Analytical Approach' paragraph).</p>
<b>Category C</b>

## Appendix 3 – Future Generations Commissioner’s Response

### Swansea Public Services Board: Well-being assessment

Feedback and advice from the Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales,  
17<sup>th</sup> March 2022

#### 1: Summary

- A strong, comprehensive well-being assessment.
- Demonstrates detailed exploration of well-being in Swansea and commitment to the Well-being of Future Generations Act.
- Draws upon a range of quantitative and qualitative sources of information and data, adding depth to key findings.
- Developed in a collaborative manner involving a team of officers from the partner organisations of Swansea PSB, in conjunction with voluntary sector bodies.
- Approach to engagement highlighted within the assessment and annex 1.
- Section 3 (below) highlights areas that if further developed would help strengthen the assessment overall. These relate to: key messages, involvement, future trends, skills for the future, equality and maximising contribution to Wales’ well-being goals. Desirable areas are also included for your consideration.

#### 2: Evidence of good practice in the well-being assessment

##### Process and methodology

The ‘Overall approach to the 2022 Assessment’ section of the introduction is helpful in providing an overview of the approach undertaken to the draft assessment. From this, you state your approach has changed since the previous assessment, and the assessment is structured around the four dimensions of well-being in the Act – a structure that works well.

It’s evident the draft assessment has been compiled in a collaborative manner involving a team of officers from the partner organisations of Swansea PSB, in conjunction with voluntary sector bodies. We note working groups were established and you highlight the wider regional collaboration with Neath Port Talbot PSB and the West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board – working together on a joint and common approach to the well-being assessments and population needs assessments.

The draft assessment has drawn upon a wide range of secondary qualitative and quantitative documents, which compliments the primary research, and adds depth to key findings. This is particularly useful where insight is provided on topics where there may not be in-depth quantitative data. For example, in discussion of poverty, the assessment draws upon research undertaken by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation’s research on Minimum Income Standard, alongside Fair By Design, to outline the key pressures likely to be felt by households on lower incomes, e.g., childcare, transport, and access to services. Likewise, this is considered in relation to digital exclusion, where data is drawn from the National Survey for Wales and Nesta, to conclude that vulnerable households are at risk, and demonstrates some existing work (e.g., ‘Our Neighbourhood’), to increase digital access and literacy in Swansea. To compliment this further, international sources add a global perspective, where, for example, lessons are drawn from ‘*Measuring Up: Comparing Public Transport in the UK and Europe’s Biggest Cities*’ by The Centre for Cities.

It is helpful the introductory letter and the ‘About the evidence’ sections within each chapter point out the evidence yet to be collected and/or fully considered, which includes the Future Trends

report. We will be particularly interested to see the findings of the academic research commissioned which aims to bring out the key implications and messages (the 'so what') from the draft assessment. We would be grateful to have sight of this work as and when it is available.

It's good to see the approach you have taken to engagement and involvement, where you have sought to supplement the data and information presented with people's experiences. It's also good to hear that *"the level and quality of response was encouraging"* to your survey in autumn 2021. Your approach to engagement is helpfully detailed within annex 1 of the assessment.

A strength of the assessment is the clear interrogation and critical reflection of data sources, particularly quantitative data. This is evident in the way gaps are outlined, such as recognising there is *'a lack of information on where digital 'not spots' are'* and noting an increase in referral numbers to support services with regard to violence against women, domestic abuse, and sexual violence may not mean an increase in incidents but in-fact increased reporting.

There is good recognition of the impact of recent events throughout the draft assessment, such as Brexit, COVID-19 and the cost of living, together with the climate and nature emergency. As you state: *"This period since the previous assessment in 2017 has in many ways been a momentous and extraordinary time"* and that these *"couldn't have been easily foreseen when the last assessment was undertaken"*.

The draft assessment is honest in its recognition of the challenges and pressures of responding to the pandemic, which has meant some partners have not been able to contribute to the assessment. You highlight this is reflected most in the 'Social' chapter, particularly in relation to physical and mental health, early years and loneliness/isolation. However, we agree that the chapter does still contain extensive information, data and analysis.

The draft assessment is comprehensive and there is good evidence of connections being made throughout. For example, the 'Economy' chapter includes a focus on climate change, decarbonisation, green infrastructure, sustainable transport and energy, and highlights connections to the other chapters in the 'integration' section.

There is an honest appraisal of the data and evidence available to inform the assessment. For example, you highlight the limitations of the 2011 Census Data and state much of the analysis included may be subject to change, as the results of the 2021 Census are expected later this year.

### **Content**

The structure of the draft assessment is clear and works well and it's particularly helpful to see a consistent format applied across each of the dimensions of well-being. This helps ensure each of the topics within the four dimensions of well-being are considered in detail, and in relation to the broader picture of well-being in Swansea.

A linked contents page upfront means the reader can navigate by topic with ease. Providing a demographic profile upfront provides useful insight to what the future of Swansea may look like. Further strengths include the introduction of each well-being chapter exploring alignment to the well-being goals, alongside an outline of key contextual factors and key sub-themes of the chapter. The inclusion of 'conclusions and key messages' at the end of each sub-topic means findings are neatly summarised. This will be particularly useful for the development of the Well-being Plan, as well as bringing issues together to help develop an overall narrative for well-being in Swansea. The inclusion of case studies and examples of projects delivered within Swansea (internal and external to the PSB) works well. These are included regularly and provide a clear picture about



challenges the PSB may be facing and how organisations and sectors are working together to address them. For example, the community cohesion projects such as Together and Tell Me More which seek to bring people from different backgrounds together.

It's reassuring the economy chapter includes a strong focus on decarbonisation. Commitments outlined in the assessment include *"increasing the resilience of the region's manufacturing base, including its (currently) relatively carbon intensive foundation industries"*. Alongside this, we note the Council has recently adopted the new South-West Wales Regional Economic Delivery Plan as its strategic framework for economic regeneration, which includes commitment to making the economy resilient to climate change and acting on decarbonisation, and aiming to establish South West Wales as a UK leader in renewable energy and the development of a net zero economy.

The assessment includes reference to recent and ongoing developments within Swansea, by consistently linking findings to the policy and strategic context. Good examples include:

- Reference to Swansea's application to the Foundational Economy Challenge Fund to test out two new approaches to the design and procurement of services in rural areas of Swansea.
- Embedding findings from NRW's Area Statement for South-West Wales.
- Swansea's Corporate Parenting Strategy 'best life' project.
- The Skills and Talent Project, from the City Deal.

It's great to see the 'Recognising and Respecting Children's Rights' feature highlighting Swansea as the first local authority in the UK to voluntarily make a public commitment to Children's Rights, and the 'Listening to Children and Young People' section within the 'social' chapter is a strength of the assessment. There is rich information in the key issues they have highlighted for your PSB to consider and reflect upon, such as protecting the environment, supporting disabled children, equality for LGBTQ+ children and young people, and developing resources to help young people better understand politics.

We note Swansea's evening and night-time economy (ENTE) has a reputation nationally as a leading light in how the sector should be managed, and it's positive to hear of your response to calls to improve safety for people, in particular women and other vulnerable groups, when visiting the city centre by day and after dark.

The chapter on environmental well-being is comprehensive, with consideration given to the key legislation, strategies and policies in place. It's particularly positive to see a focus on food within the 'Soils, land use and food' section of the assessment, which includes sharing the example from a survey that found 94% of 183 respondents in Swansea would consider joining a CSA veg box scheme, and sharing key messages from the 'Food for the Region' conference. We also note the section indicates a recommendation to pursue a food strategy for Swansea.

The draft assessment also includes a strong chapter on cultural well-being. It's great to hear about the new 'Diversity Pledge for Culture' in the city, which represents a commitment to diversification of audiences, and support to ensure communities with protected characteristics have fair and equal representation and access to your programming. We also note Swansea is signed up to Culture 21 (Agenda 21 for Culture) within the European cohort, and were the first UK city to do so.

### 3: Areas that could be further developed

#### Important areas for consideration

There is much to be commended on your work and approach to the draft well-being assessment. Building on the extensive work already undertaken, below are areas we consider to be important for your consideration. If developed further, they would help strengthen the assessment overall.

#### Key messages

We note reference to the academic research the PSB has commissioned to highlight the key implications and messages (the 'so what') from the draft well-being assessment.

While this is positive to hear, it's not clear from the information set out if these findings would be included in the final well-being assessment, or if this is intended as information aimed at PSB members to help inform next steps as attention shifts to the well-being plan? Clarity on this within the assessment would be helpful. We would also be interested to see the findings of the work.

#### Involvement

Your approach to involvement is helpfully detailed within annex 1 of the draft assessment. This outlines the three key phases of the work: an online survey; working with partners to make the most of existing events and opportunities; and the consultation process of the draft assessment itself. Annex 1 also provides a helpful overview of the responses, set out in relation to the four dimensions of well-being.

It's reassuring to hear "*the level and quality of response was encouraging*" to your survey in autumn 2021 and your "*approach aims to ensure that gaps are identified and seldom heard from voices considered.*" The 'Listening to Children and Young People' section within the 'social' chapter is a strength of the assessment and we note the comment that a priority for the PSB is meaningful and inclusive opportunities for children and young people to be heard in decisions that affect them.

Similarly, the Ageing Well Steering Group used a range of methods for engaging people 50+ in an effort to increase accessibility and uptake of the consultation, to which 236 responses were received which highlighted some of the key issues they wish to work on to make Swansea a better place to live. It's also good to see the social care section (under 'social') state that the priority is to ensure co-production remains central to the planning, design and delivery of services.

Building on your positive work to date, we encourage you to consider including further information (and reflection) on the following:

- What you consider to be the strengths and challenges of your engagement work to date.
- Identifying the 'seldom heard voices' you are seeking to involve.
- Any approaches or tools you've identified that could potentially improve your work to involve people going forward.
- Using and including quotes from residents within the assessment (we note annex 1 states these will be included in the final published assessment).

Using and adopting strong, innovative involvement techniques that go beyond engagement and move more towards co-production is important for all PSBs. To help inform the next stages of the well-being planning process, the Co-production Network for Wales is producing advice and guidance based on the way in which involvement and co-production has been embedded in the well-being process so far. We encourage your PSB teams and coordinators to help shape this guidance with Co-Production Network for Wales, as it develops.

## **Future Trends**

While the draft assessment provides a comprehensive overview of well-being in the area, we acknowledge your statement that this is an early draft, and the Future Trends Report is yet to be fully considered.

As currently set out, it is helpful the structure of the draft assessment includes a 'Future Trends and Prospects for Swansea' section for (most of) the topics that fall under each dimension of well-being, and there is valuable information contained within some of these sections. Data on longer-term demographics aside, the environment chapter is perhaps the strongest in looking longer-term, due in part to the challenges faced by the climate and nature emergency, and how that links directly to challenges such as ecosystem resilience, water resources, flood risk etc.

Building on the structure you have adopted for the draft assessment, we recommend full consideration is given to the [Future Trends Report](#) (published in December 2021) to help better inform and strengthen the assessment. This should be carried out in relation to and across all four dimensions of well-being.

Looking ahead, it would also be helpful to understand how the PSB intends to continue to consider and embed future trends information into its next steps, including the development of a well-being plan and setting of objectives and steps. Futures techniques are effective tools for engaging with others and prompting constructive discussion in a way that can help develop plans that deliver meaningful change.

In their feedback to PSBs, NRW are offering to run Three Horizons workshop to help support the incorporation of future trends into the well-being planning process. We encourage your PSB to take up this offer if you haven't already. Our Three Horizons toolkit is available [here](#).

## **Skills for the future**

There is good information contained within the 'Swansea's workforce' section and it's positive to hear the Council and its local/regional partners are working to create a more skilled workforce in the future. This includes sharing examples of several initiatives, including the recently approved Skills and Talent project under the Swansea Bay City Deal, which will work to develop skills in the region, plugging the skills gaps in many sectors.

With the ongoing and forthcoming regeneration projects including Copr Bay, The Kingsway and Blue Eden projects in mind, and the continued growth of the city's two universities, we encourage you to consider the findings in our [recent report](#) on the skills needed to transition to a low carbon economy. It finds that across Wales there are significant skills gaps in green industries which must be addressed.

This could be explored further within the 'Future trends and prospects for Swansea' area of the 'Swansea workforce' section and in relation to the discussion of school attainment and training and education provision in the region. Clear links should also be made to your local Regional Skills Partnership.

## **Equality**

The draft assessment is strong in its consideration of equality. Examples of good practice includes the discussion of domestic violence and its consideration of different identities (and changing statistics). For example, *"The percentage of BAME cases referred to MARAC has remained in the region of 6.6% and 7.4% since 2018 with less than 1% fluctuation year on year. However, the*

*specialist advice service for BAME victims saw a significant drop in numbers from 2018 to 2021, possibly correlating to the lack of outreach events due to the pandemic.”*

Other examples highlighted include Swansea being the first local authority area in Wales to set up a Poverty Truth Commission and the Council passing a motion expressing its solidarity with BAME communities in Swansea and across the world in their fight for justice, which also committed the Council to celebrating and memorialising a greater range of Swansea’s citizens of the past, particularly women, BAME, disabled, LGBT and working-class people. Swansea has also been a City of Sanctuary since 2010 and an asylum seeker dispersal area since 2001. In the culture chapter, the assessment also discusses engagement with the Black Lives Matter movement in the summer of 2020, alongside events and celebrations such as LGBT+ month and Diwali.

The assessment also provides a thorough analysis and exploration of crime in Swansea, covering a wide range of topics which includes: Violence Against Women, Domestic Abuse and Sexual Violence; substance misuse; street vulnerability; evening and night time economy; hate crime; community cohesion and wildfires.

We acknowledge the assessment highlights existing gaps. Building on the positive work undertaken to date, we recommend:

- Ensuring all [‘protected characteristics’](#) outlined in the Equality Act are considered within the assessment.
- Some consideration is given to how intersectionality affects people in the area. For example, what is like to be young and LGBTQ+ in Swansea? We note in the ‘Listening to young people’ section, children and young people highlighted ‘Equality for LGBTQ+ children and young people’ as a key issue.
- Making the links to your engagement work on engaging with seldom heard voices, as this develops.

We also encourage you to consider the implications of our recent [‘Inequality in a future Wales’](#) report. This highlights the how future of work, changing demographics and climate change could increase existing inequalities if the impacts on different groups in society are not factored in.

**Maximising the PSB’s contribution to Wales’ well-being goals**

Understanding the full definition of Wales’ well-being goals can help ensure the assessment is considering the wide range of topics and themes of well-being within your area.

The table below sets out areas that could be explored further within the assessment, and/or taken into consideration for the well-being plan.

It is appreciated that it may not be possible for all the information below to be fully considered / incorporated in your assessment. Instead, you may wish to choose some areas to compliment the extensive work you have already undertaken:

<b>Welsh Language</b>	The draft assessment provides strong consideration of the Welsh language. This includes key statistics, cultural initiatives and events in the area, making the links to Cymraeg 2050 and the important role Swansea played in the history of Welsh language and culture: <i>“The Welsh Language owes much to the history of Swansea; the deep roots of the language and it’s literature can be traced back beyond the medieval period through Welsh language poets and their patrons”</i> .
-----------------------	--

	As the PSB's attention shifts to the well-being plan, we recommend clear links are made to your local authority's promotional strategy and your relevant Welsh in Education Strategic Plan (WESP).
<b>Fair and local procurement</b>	The assessment acknowledges " <i>Local sourcing of goods and services by residents, businesses and public sector plays an important role in both supporting the local economy and reducing environmental impact.</i> " Our <a href="#">bitesize resource on procurement</a> provides a helpful summary on the Commissioner's vision for procurement, identifying the key issues highlighted by public bodies during the research and Section 20 Review, as well as the recommendations outlined in our ' <a href="#">Procuring well-being in Wales</a> ' report.
<b>Brexit</b>	Likely to have an impact for Swansea and its residents, e.g., EU citizens residing in the city, the ability of businesses to import and export goods, and sectors such as tourism and the creative industries that have relied on free movement of people. The WCPP's briefing: ' <a href="#">The impacts of Covid-19 and Brexit on well-being</a> ' is a helpful resource on this.
<b>Regional Skills Partnership</b>	It's not clear if the links have been made with your local Regional Skills Partnership. Your assessment will be a significant resource for them. Similarly, their strategies and priorities will be key for your PSB. Please also see above points on skills for the future.

#### Other areas for consideration (desirable)

These are areas you might wish to amend / update to strengthen the assessment overall:

- **Localised data:** The draft assessment provides some breakdown of data to smaller geographies within Swansea, but this could be more consistent through the document (where possible to do so). Comparison of different areas can be helpful to highlight local inequalities, any best practice from programmes delivered at a local level, and to identify where targeted interventions may be required.
- **Integration:** A strong feature of the assessment which recognises many issues are interconnected. Structuring a well-being assessment by well-being dimension does work well but there are some sections where clearer links could be made to other areas/chapters of the assessment. For example, the chapter on poverty is extensive and includes fuel and food poverty, and further links could be made here to the environment and economy chapters. Similarly, while integration is discussed in relation to digital connectivity where it states: "*there are also links to aspects of the social chapter, including housing and poverty*", it would be helpful in examples like this if some further information/context could be provided on how this is the case.
- **Collaboration:** Building on the collaborative approach taken to developing the assessment in the region, it would be beneficial if the assessment identified *who* all the partners were and *how* the collaboration was managed. This information would help for future learning, as cross-sector collaboration is a challenging but often effective means of delivering social change.
- **Overall conclusions:** The 'economy' chapter finishes with a section on 'Overall Conclusions'. For consistency, you may wish to include a similar section in the other three main chapters.
- **Net Zero:** The environment chapter refers to Welsh Government's Low Carbon Delivery Plan (Prosperity for All, 2019). Please note, this document has been updated and replaced with '[Net Zero](#)'.

### Minor considerations

There are a few minor considerations with formatting you may wish to address for the final assessment:

- The subheading 'adult social care' is the same as the topic heading 'social care'. This could be made clearer.
- Links to the sub-topics where they are listed in the introductory chapter would be beneficial and increase navigability.
- Reference not included properly on page 151. Similarly, text for 'insert image' remains on page 201.

### 4: Resources to help inform your next steps

Below are resources that can help inform your next steps, as you move from well-being assessment to well-being plan:

- Chapter 4 of the Future Generations Report: ['Setting Good Well-being Objectives'](#)
- The ['Future Generations Framework for Projects'](#)
- [Case studies](#) of how the Act is being implemented on the ground in Wales
- Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales: [Resources](#)

## Appendix 4 – Natural Resources Wales Response

18th March 2022

Dear Councillor Lewis, Chair of Swansea Public Services Board

### Well-being Assessment Consultation Response from NRW

Thank you for providing us with the opportunity to respond formally to the Swansea Well-being Assessment. In order to provide targeted and co-ordinated support to all of our Public Services Boards, we have arranged our feedback into the following categories:

- (i) Items which are special or significant and distinct to place
- (ii) Assessment and analysis of Environmental Well-being
- (iii) Future trends
- (iv) Application of the Climate Change Risk Assessment for Wales (CCRA3)
- (v) Inequalities between communities and exposure to environmental risk

Beneath each heading we have considered our recommendations for the assessment, our aspirations for future development of the well-being plan and the NRW contribution to all of the above as an integral partner in the Well-being planning process.

The above categories have been drawn from [Welsh Government's Statutory guidance \(SPSF3\)](#) on the collective role of Public Services Boards. NRW will use these categories in combination with the framework for assessing Environmental Well-being provided by [SoNaRR2020](#) to inform all of our consultation responses. Where applicable, we will also draw on local information and evidence gathered as part of our Area Statements. For more information on how we will use this information and that which lies behind the categories listed below please refer to the attached briefing note: Well-being Planning Framework for Approval.

NRW will aim to provide formal written feedback on PSB products at three separate intervals during the development of Well-being Plans. This will include this round of Well-being Assessment consultation, again following the development of draft Well-being objectives, and for one final time during Well-being plan Consultation.

Each stage will allow NRW to involve as wide a range of technical specialists as possible within our own organisation. The process will also provide the NRW board with a documented story of Well-being Plan development in each place. This will be invaluable to them at the end of the process when they are looking to sign off each individual Well-being Plan.

Please contact your local PSB rep for information about next steps and NRW involvement.

Yours sincerely

Martyn Evans

Head of Operations South West Wales

Tel: 07468 742564

Direct e-mail: [martyn.p.evans@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk](mailto:martyn.p.evans@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk)



# NRW Well-being Assessment Consultation for Swansea Public Service Board

## 1. Items which are special or significant and distinct to place

### Findings: Meeting Expected

It is clear, particularly through key strategies and commitments supported by well-established as well as emerging / newer partnerships, that Swansea has many strengths and assets to call upon to respond swiftly to the growing challenges of climate change and biodiversity decline, and other environmental risks that impact well-being in Swansea now, and those which are predicted to intensify in future. This is reflected well throughout the document and in all chapters.

Overall, the Environment chapter of the draft Well-being Assessment does well in presenting information, data, and evidence to reflect the significance and value of Swansea's natural environment. However, **reference/s to natural resources** and the risks, impacts and opportunities associated with them **across all well-being dimensions could be more spatially specific** to better reflect important differences, inequalities, and the range of challenges and responses needed. Doing so will better inform and aid subsequent discussions and priority setting, helping ensure resources are committed where they are most needed for a green and just future. If adding this information to the final version of the assessment is not possible within timescales, it would be helpful to note that this will be sought and brought into discussions regards well-being plan objectives and priorities. A particular theme we would encourage the PSB to explore spatially is that of equality of access to and use of high quality, natural green and blue space, and equality of access to active and sustainable travel.

In addition to environmental well-being, our natural assets deliver preventative, cost-effective, and long-term nature-based solutions to some of our most complex social, economic, and cultural needs, e.g., preventative and therapeutic health interventions, and addressing socio-economic inequalities, a regenerative and net-zero economy. 'Integration' is a Topic sub-heading within each chapter and this has helped raise awareness and focus minds on making linkages within / between chapters and topics. It is recommended that the Assessment and evolving well-being planning process looks builds on these high-level linkages to ensure that well-being is considered 'in the round', key cross-cutting themes are identified, and the ground is paved for meaningful collaboration to tackle issues such as transformation of the food, energy, and transportation systems. In the absence of time to fully explore these, it would be helpful for the Assessment to commit the PSB to exploring the opportunities and conflicts / challenges of cross-cutting themes to inform the next phases of the Well-being planning process.

It is particularly heartening to see that young people (in response to a consultation exercise) have as their number one priority, 'Protecting the Environment and Green Spaces' (*ref Social Chapter, Listening to Children and Young People: Perceptions and Perspectives*); it will be paramount to ensure these conversations are continued with support for YP to be involved in decision-making about their future in Swansea particularly around this theme. Perhaps the PSB's Human Rights City Steering Group may be in a position to take this forward?

If timings allow, it would be good to include any feedback from NRW and WG's Natur a Ni project that has been received from people living / working in Swansea. We will be happy to coordinate this with our colleagues.

Recommendations for the Assessment	Aspirations for future Well-being Plan development	NRW Contributions
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>To set the scene and give important context from the start of this key assessment, and as Swansea's outstanding natural environment is a major part of the county's identity and a big draw to visitors, a 'Place Profile' giving a more detailed overview of landscape and natural assets could be added following the 'Demographic Profile' chapter that is already included. <i>NRW is happy to provide draft text for this – see Appendix A.</i></li> <li>In the Cultural chapter, page 197, it is noted that, "Swansea's key strength is its unique mix of city, coast and country offer within one destination. With award winning and globally recognised beaches, parks with green flag status and Britain's first Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, it is important to recognise the vital role the natural environment plays in boosting residents and visitors wellbeing."</li> </ul> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> The above statement to acknowledge that Swansea's natural resources and resilience are at risk from overuse, the climate and nature emergencies, and these risks are likely to become more challenging to address if not done so now, impacting the sustainability of the tourism offer and benefits to local economic wellbeing.</p>	<p>As we move forwards into the well-being planning phase the assessment provides a good basis for PSB partners to consider in greater depth the factors and cross-cutting issues which are distinct to Swansea including the direct reliance on natural assets. Doing so will help us ensure the risks to and opportunities for our natural resources are recognised and better understood by stakeholders, and their maintenance, management, improvement and / or protection be appropriately resourced to improve the wellbeing of current as well as future generations.</p> <p>Linkages to be explored with NPT (and other?) PSBs, and within the context of the economically and culturally significant Swansea Bay City Region. The current joint consultancy exercise between Swansea and NPT may provide a good opportunity for this exploring links between these two areas.</p>	<p>NRW has offered the PSB an opportunity to be involved in hosting a focus group to jointly explore what citizens want for the future of the natural environment and the actions we can all take to safeguard it. This would form part of the national conversation (Natur a Ni / Nature and Us) being hosted by NRW with support from Welsh Government. The results of this focus group, together with the outputs from the national conversation specific to your PSB area, can be woven into longer-term planning through the development of the Well-being Plan."</p> <p>Please contact <a href="mailto:NaturaNi@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk">NaturaNi@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</a> for more information about this offer. This is a central team who will work closely with your regional contacts to ensure that we are complementing and not diverting resources away from ongoing activity.</p> <p><b>Contact has been made with the Natur a Ni team, and participants invited from Swansea, with some further activity planned. Results from conversations in Swansea will be shared with the PSB in due course.</b></p>

## 2. Assessment and analysis of Environmental Well-being

### Findings: Meeting expected

The Environment chapter provides a good summation of local and national data and evidence as they relate to environmental well-being in Swansea, and this detail is reinforced by remarks relating to climate change and natural resources throughout other chapters. For example, the positive reference to beaches and parks / green space as important natural assets for cultural and economic well-being, particularly tourism, but also as an amenity that innately enhances well-being. However, this could be strengthened by considering the risks / challenges and future trends for these assets and knock-on effects (the 'so what?') for longer-term and sustainable cultural and economic well-being.

Data sets are contextualised by using corresponding and complementary evidence from a range of sources including Water Framework Directive data, Climate Change Risk Assessment 3 (CCRA3) report, information and data on SINC condition, Local Nature Recovery Action Plan data and evidence, SW Area Statement, and SoNaRR 2020. Although use of this evidence is, in the main, limited to the Environment chapter, it should be noted that the findings of these key reports, particularly SoNaRR, CCRA3, and Area Statements are relevant to all aspects of well-being.

As well as details on current and planned regeneration / development activity in Swansea, references to natural resources, in particular to climate change, decarbonisation, and green infrastructure, are made in the Economic chapter. In the next phase of the well-being planning process, this discussion could perhaps go further and ask itself the 'so what' question - what / how the the programme of regeneration will, for example, embed and respond to the need to adapt and mitigate for climate change in the longer-term, including implications for flood risk areas, and enabling active and sustainable travel into the city centre and other key employment hubs, attractions, and facilities.

High-level linkages are made between environmental and other dimensions of well-being in all chapters, which help highlight further discussions around opportunity for cross-partner collaborations.

It is noted that the Environment chapter rightly states the **climate and nature emergencies as being interwoven** and that they must be addressed together, and reference to this is made throughout the chapter. The assessment also includes information on the risks to environmental well-being, including competing land use, habitat loss and degradation, climate change, water quality and quantity, etc. The risks are multiple and relevant to all other dimensions of well-being. A broader and more integrated analysis of the social and economic drivers of sustainable natural resource management (aims three and four of SoNaRR2020) would be beneficial to make sure the PSB is **tackling the root cause of issues that are driving unsustainable management**.

Due to the acknowledged gap on (mental and physical) health in the Social section, there has not been opportunity to identify and discuss the **significant links between health and natural resources**, particularly active travel, air and water quality, access to green and blue space, flood risk, GI, etc... although there is mention of these associations within topics under the Environment chapter. We would welcome opportunity to work with PSB partners to input to health topics and / or **provide some narrative to acknowledge these important links** and commit to exploring them in the development of objective and priority setting for the Well-being Plan.

Recommendations	Aspirations	NRW Contributions
<p>Include narrative and refs to case studies / relevant research and policy on links between health and natural resources, and nature-based solutions for health and well-being.</p>	<p>Since the last round of Well-being planning, there have been a number of significant shifts in public discussion and understanding in relation to the environment, climate change, and natural resources in Wales. The <b>overwhelming message from SoNaRR is that societal transformation is needed in the Food, Energy and Mobility systems</b>, which are referred to within the assessment. The connections between all four dimensions of well-being are being made apparent in the playing out of everyday events, writ large during Covid and, now, with fuel, energy, and food supply and pricing being impacted, and recent inflation not seen for decades. So, it is important to <b>consider environmental well-being in this integrated way</b> so that we can ensure we are acting for the longer term and tackling the root cause of issues that are contributing towards the climate and nature emergencies.</p> <p>Accompanying this is an increasing appreciation of the need for co-ordinated public sector responses. As the Public Services Board moves from well-being assessment and into the response analysis phase, it will be important to identify how <b>collaborative public sector working can drive transformation in the food, energy and transport sectors</b> and identify what levers we have locally that can help shape and drive this transformation for the benefit of current and future generations.</p>	<p>Depending on the interest of PSB partners, NRW would welcome the opportunity to develop our shared understanding of how collective interventions may shape transformation in the food, energy and transport systems as recommended by SoNaRR2020. For an introductory overview please see: <a href="#">SoNaRR2020 Main messages Video - Welsh subtitles</a></p>

### 3. Future Trends

**Findings: Meeting expected**

Under the 'Future Trends' sub-heading in each topic section, reference to future trends is made throughout the document indicating that consideration of them and their potential impact on well-being in Swansea has been made. The Environment chapter does this well particularly with reference to, and within the context of, the inherently longer timescales and timelags associated with climate change and biodiversity decline, and where there is much research and policy to refer to. However, in some other sections the **draft narrative could be strengthened by analysing the implications of the findings of the Future Trends Wales report** to greater depth.

As part of the response analysis and ongoing discussions leading to the next stage of the well-being planning process, it may be helpful to **draw out common 'challenges' or risks that should be addressed collectively through a futures thinking exercise**, which may help to identify joint priorities and objectives for the next well-being plan. Greater detail from more in-depth consultation and engagement with partners and stakeholders about potential future scenarios should provide additional, and in some cases more meaningful, insights as to how PSB partners could respond to any of the predicted future trends.

NRW would like to work with PSB partners to jointly review the future trend analysis over the remainder of the well-being planning process.

<b>Recommendations</b>	<b>Aspirations</b>	<b>NRW Contributions</b>
With reference to Future Trends Wales report, build-on the draft narrative to draw out and add details across chapters / topics, as are relevant to Swansea.	As the PSB moves forward into response analysis it will be important to make sure that we work extensively with a wide range of partners and stakeholders to collaborate and co-produce an analysis of the “possible” future trends and their potential impact on Swansea. This work should include demonstrating the use of multiple relevant futures resources such as Go-Science UK trend deck, Future Trends Wales Report, plus things like private sector scenarios and other sources as needed. NRW would like to support the PSB to use future trends tools and resources to produce multiple scenarios and/or options for delivery. This work should help inform ongoing decision making at the PSB.	NRW would like to offer to run a 'Three Horizons' workshop, to help support the incorporation of future trends into the next phase of well-being planning.

## 4. Application of the Climate Change Risk Assessment for Wales (CCRA3)

### Findings: Meeting Expected

Climate change, and associated risks or impacts, is mentioned many times throughout the document, and there is important acknowledgement that both the Climate and Nature Emergencies are inter-related challenges which cannot be tackled in isolation. The assessment contains narrative on climate change risk and impacts at a high-level, although does detail those communities at a greater level of flood risk. There is opportunity and need to enhance this assessment and its usefulness in informing further discussions through more detailed assessment of potential impacts on key assets, including infrastructure, protected areas/habitats, and communities. This could be done by identifying, as relevant across all four well-being dimensions, those **risks which the Climate Change Risk Assessment 3 (CCRA3) Welsh summary report lists as high magnitude and requiring action now, and what they mean for specific communities and aspects of well-being.**

Recommendations	Aspirations	NRW Contributions
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Include in the document, where most relevant, responses regards climate change that were received through well-being assessment survey, engagement activities, and consultation, particularly lived experience.</li> <li>• Add / update narrative with reference to the latest findings of the IPCC 6<sup>th</sup> Assessment report:   <i>“The cumulative scientific evidence is unequivocal: Climate change is a threat to human well-being and planetary health. Any further delay in concerted anticipatory global action on adaptation and mitigation will miss a brief and rapidly closing window of opportunity to secure a liveable and sustainable future for all.”</i> IPCC Sixth Assessment Report, 2022                      It is recommended to also refer to:                 </li> <li>• The Climate and Nature charter</li> </ul>	<p>As the PSB moves forward into response analysis it will be important to undertake analysis (even if only qualitative) of all the CCRA3 risks relevant to the PSB area, and to better understand the degree to which they are already recognised and mitigated. Any place specific local risks should be identified. The PSB should detail potential impacts on communities and infrastructure along with impacts on habitats. To do this, it will be important to set out risk management approaches and opportunities to adapt to risks, such as opportunities for nature-based solutions to support coastal adaptation. The PSB should also set out opportunities for engagement with affected communities to enable delivery of the measures or at least to develop an approach for this. For all those risks relevant Swansea a</p>	<p>NRW would like to support the PSB to analyse climate risks and opportunities as they relate specifically to Swansea. NRW would also like to continue to support and actively participate in development and subsequent delivery of a climate strategy for Swansea.</p>



<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The work Swansea Council is leading, with support from SEF and the WWN task group, and how this work will help to get a fuller picture of how identified impacts will be addressed, and how current policies and strategies link to the ability to manage risks.</li> <li>• It may be that the above warrants the addition of a climate change topic although, ideally, this should be addressed across and by all dimensions of well-being.</li> </ul>	<p>prioritisation exercise should be undertaken to identify those requiring urgent action as informed by the CCRA3 risk classification i.e., more action needed/further investigation/sustain current action/watching brief. (This will require an assessment of the degree to which current policy and practice along with any existing adaptation and risk management measures are able to manage those risks.)</p>	
--	---	--

## 5. Inequalities between communities and exposure to environmental risk

<p><b>Findings: Developing</b>  The well-being assessment explores inequalities between different demographic groups and communities in Swansea mainly from a social and economic perspective. Although this provides critically important insights, environmental inequalities resulting from different levels of exposure to environmental risks are only partially addressed. The links between all well-being dimensions and their causal relationships on inequalities are not fully considered and therefore remain unclear. <b>A more integrated perspective and understanding of this topic should be developed as this would generate valuable additional insights.</b></p>		
Recommendations	Aspirations	NRW Contributions
<p>Refer to and include, where relevant, findings and recommendations from the FGC for Wales report: <a href="#">Inequality in a Future Wales: Areas for action in work, climate and demographic change</a>.</p> <p>This may help highlight priority areas (topical, soci-economic, spatial) in</p>	<p>As the PSB moves forward into response analysis it will be important to identify environmental and socio-economic inequalities between and within communities. This would include <b>reference to specific communities which are more vulnerable to environmental risks and hazards</b>. This includes but is not limited to flood risk,</p>	<p>NRW would like to support the PSB to develop a more integrated understanding of inequalities in Swansea and to explore nature-based solutions to alleviate certain aspects and manifestations of inequalities. Our support could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Online training webinar to support PSB to link health, education, and nature.</li> </ul>

<p>Swansea for further discussion.</p>	<p>poor air quality, noise pollution, water quality (water supply and bathing waters: public health impact) and INNS (public health impact).  The PSB should work together to evidence an understanding and analysis of the socio-economic demographics of the communities within Swansea, e.g., poor water quality areas should be identifying the socio-economic impacts on people and communities.  Further data sets such as the <a href="#">Welsh Information for Nature-based Solutions</a> could also be referenced to highlight some of the potential opportunities to tackle inequalities arising from different levels of exposure to environmental risks and benefits within the PSB area</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NRW Health Impact Assessment (HIA) guidance and tools to support integrated thinking about natural resources and health, for example a training session on Wider Determinants of Health and outline of HIA with focus on environment.</li> <li>• Use of the Welsh Information for Nature-based Solutions' (WINS) data and maps to identify priority areas for nature-based solutions to air quality, pluvial flooding, noise pollution and access to green space. This data combines environmental mapping, population density and deprivation to identify priority areas for nature-based solutions. It is a good example of how to tackle health and wider inequalities.</li> </ul>
--	--	--

*Please also see Appendix A for further suggestions of text amendments or additions that may enable the relevant linkages and cross references across chapters/themes.*



## Appendix A

- Proposed text for section on Swansea's landscape following 'Demographic Profile' on page 10.

The Gower peninsula is renowned for its scenic quality, particularly the coastline and prominent open hills such as Rhossili Down and Cefn Bryn, its attractive sea and coastal views and strong sense of place. A large part is designated as an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB), the UK's first. The Swansea area has spectacular geology and geomorphology, which is internationally important, with 20 geological Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI), 9 regionally important geological and geomorphological sites (RIGs) and more. The well-visited south Gower coast is indented, with rocky cliffs, headlands and sandy bays backed by dunes; the coastline of north Gower is noted for its broad estuarine marshes, part of the internationally important Carmarthen Bay and Estuaries Special Area of Conservation and boasts views across the Loughor estuary. Inland Gower has open rolling farmland fields and hedges with picturesque and tranquil rural villages. Historic interest is evident throughout rural Gower, including the medieval field system of the Vile at Rhossili and prehistoric features of the uplands. Gower is extremely important for coastal recreation, including surfing, sailing, and swimming and for walking along the coast and uplands. Tourism, in particular camping and caravan parks feature strongly. Around the edges of Swansea, commons, small wooded valleys and farmland provide opportunities for walking, cycling and horse riding. Crymlyn Bog is a nationally important nature reserve, and parkland and forest at Penllergaer provide informal recreation. Away from the M4 corridor, these areas can be peaceful. Mumbles Head and the sweeping beach of Swansea Bay define the city's coast and provide the focus for coastal recreation, walking and cycling routes. Open upland rolling hills and valleys dominate the northern part of the area, with extensive views over Carmarthenshire and the Black Mountain. The uplands are also important areas for recreation. Settlements, woodland, and pasture dominate the valleys, which are important routes for walking and cycling, often associated with historic infrastructure such as canals and disused railways as in the Tawe Valley.

- Recommended adjustments in Cultural chapter:

In the Cultural chapter, page 197, it is noted that, "Swansea's key strength is its unique mix of city, coast and country offer within one destination. With award winning and globally recognised beaches, parks with green flag status and Britain's first Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, it is important to recognise the vital role the natural environment plays in boosting residents and visitors wellbeing."

**Recommendation:** The above statement to acknowledge that Swansea's natural resources and resilience are at risk from overuse, the climate and nature emergencies, and these risks are likely to become more challenging to address if not done so now, impacting the sustainability of the tourism offer and benefits to local economic wellbeing.

### **Climate Change – Cultural Heritage**

The effects of Climate change will be felt across society, including by our built and tangible heritage assets. The relevant risks and opportunities are outlined in the third UK Climate Change Risk Assessment (CCRA3).

The main current risks to cultural heritage relate to extreme weather fluctuations including increasing temperatures (heatwaves or fires), precipitation and flooding, coastal processes, and from unintended consequences of climate mitigation and adaptation measures within the heritage sector and across other sectors. In particular, coastal heritage sites are at threat from a combination of hazards; sea level rise leading to increased flooding and coastal erosion; driving rain and landscape character changes.

Examples of how climate related pressures impact heritage assets include waterlogging of archaeological sites, damp problems and water ingress issues at historic properties, changes in groundwater levels affecting historic gardens, new pest species threatening heritage landscapes, damage to assets caused by wildfires and flooding and heat risks to collections and archives. It is important that we are aware of these risks and put in place preventative measures to protect our heritage assets where we can.

However, it is inevitable that we will not be able to save all our assets. Risk management of cultural heritage sites may need to include consultation and engagement with affected communities to accept inevitable loss of heritage sites to climate change hazards.

While our cultural heritage faces large risk from climate change, there are some potential opportunities for cultural heritage through the indirect effects of climate change, such as rising temperatures leading to increased visitor footfall and boosting the local economy. Although we must also recognise that increased visitors can also lead to erosion of heritage sites.

- Recommended additional narrative for Economic chapter:

#### **Circular Economy and Covid 19**

We know that in Wales we are not using our natural resources sustainably. If everyone consumed the same amount of resources as we do in Wales, then we would need two and a half planets to support us. The consequences of this overshoot are already being felt in the shape of climate change and biodiversity decline. In response, the Welsh Government has set out its ambitions for a circular economy, supporting a green and just recovery, in its [Beyond Recycling](#) strategy.

A circular economy keeps resources and materials in use for as long as possible and avoids all waste. This will mean moving away from a 'linear economy' which assumes a constant supply of natural resources or the take-make-use-dispose culture based on the extraction of resources, the production of goods and services, and the disposal of post-consumer waste.

The circular economy offers an approach which can work to reduce consumption. Taking a circular economy approach is a key pillar of a green and just recovery, helping not only to address the climate and nature crisis, but also driving better and more equitable economic outcomes for Wales.

We already have a strong foundation for a circular economy here in Wales, with a strong track record in recycling. Wales is a world leader when it comes to recycling and is currently ranked third best in the world. The Welsh Government's £1 billion investment since devolution in household recycling has helped see recycling rates increase from just 4.8% in 1998-1999, to over 65% in 2020-21. This high rate of household recycling in Wales saves over 400,000 tonnes of CO2 per year from being released into the atmosphere and is a key contribution to tackling the climate and nature emergencies.

We have learned a lot through the Covid-19 pandemic, our recovery from which represents a once in a generation opportunity to reset our individual and collective values and priorities, realigning them with those required to create a more sustainable future. The consensus across Wales, UK, Europe and beyond is that recovery from Covid-19 must address the underlying nature and climate emergencies. The calls for individuals, businesses, governments and global institutions to refocus and accelerate the response to the pandemic along a pathway which both restores nature and decarbonises our economy have been increasing in strength. This integrated approach would consider nature and climate together as the foundation of economic, social and political renewal and regeneration in Wales, reflecting the focus of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015.

It would be helpful also to include reference to the suite of projects under Swansea Bay City Deal that contribute to the low carbon / net zero ambitions of the region, in particular Homes as Power Stations, Supporting Innovation and Low Carbon Growth, Skills and Talent.